

# The Fifth of May

## The Death of Sūn Cè

Yáng Zhèngyuán

### ABSTRACT

On the Fifth of May, 200, the warlord Sūn Cè died. He was twenty-five. This paper discusses his death and provides an annotated translation of the portion of his biographical entry in the *Sān Guó zhì* concerning his death.

### INTRODUCTION

Amid the collapse of the Hàn Dynasty (206 BC – 220),<sup>1</sup> the young warlord Sūn Cè<sup>2</sup> came to prominence in the southeast, in the region about the lower Yángzǐ river (or Jiāng). The Sūn clan had its origins in that area, but the family was of minor lineage and only became notable in the time of Sūn Cè's father, the successful general Sūn Jiān.<sup>3</sup> In 191, the first stages of the civil war in the collapse of Hàn, Sūn Jiān died in battle, when Sūn Cè was about sixteen. Though still young, Sūn Cè was charismatic and already building a personal following, and about 194 he joined his father's former patron Yuán Shù<sup>4</sup> to ask for his father's former command. Yuán Shù entrusted Sūn Cè with operations east of the Yángzǐ river, which he quickly conquered in a series of brilliant campaigns. In 197, as Yuán Shù rejected Hàn authority and claimed Imperial title himself, Sūn Cè renounced his ties to Yuán Shù and established an independent position in his conquered territories. He continued his expansion, threatening to move west up the Yángzǐ or north into the Huái river valley, but in 200 he was assassinated. He was twenty-five.

As Sūn Cè rose from humble origins, flourished as a talented military commander, and died tragically young, it is perhaps unsurprising that his story, though brief, should have attracted a degree of attention within the larger mythos surrounding the downfall of Hàn and its ultimate division into three states, one of which was founded by Sūn Cè's brother Sun Quán.<sup>5</sup> Several conflicting accounts surround his death and are preserved in his biographical entry in the *Sān Guó zhì*, and though the details are contradictory and some are certainly ahistorical, the accounts are valuable for the picture they give on the historical context and challenges faced by Sūn Cè and his successors in establishing their power.

---

<sup>1</sup> The history of the later Hàn dynasty is given in Fàn Yè's *Hòu Hàn shū* (HHS), with additional information on its collapse covered in Chén Shòu's *Sān Guó zhì* (SGZ) with annotations by Péi Sōngzhī. These works, with Sīmǎ Qiān's *Shǐ jì* (SJ) and Bàn Gù's *Hàn shū* (HS) are together known as the Four Early Histories. For a narrative history see also chapters 59 – 69 of Sīmǎ Guāng's *Zīzhì Tōngjiàn*, translated into English in de Crespigny *To Establish Peace*.

<sup>2</sup> Sūn Cè (175 – 200) has a biography in SGZ 46, attached to the biography of his father Sūn Jiān (155 – 191). See also de Crespigny *Generals of the South*, chapter 3 “The Young Gentleman Sun Ce,” p. 146 – 200.

<sup>3</sup> Information on the Sūn clan's background is given at the beginning of Sūn Jiān's biography in SGZ 46; the clan could claim no famous ancestor more recent than Sūn Wǔ of about six hundred years prior. The name of Sūn Jiān's own father is not even recorded in SGZ. See also the discussion in de Crespigny *Generals of the South* 71 – 74.

<sup>4</sup> Yuán Shù (d. 199) has biographies in SGZ 6 and HHS 75.

<sup>5</sup> Sūn Quán (182 – 252) has a biography in SGZ 47.

## Tense Relationships with the North

While Sūn Cè was engaged in conquering the southeast, the central plains were gradually dominated by two major warlords. The stronger of the two, Yuán Shào, an elder cousin of Yuán Shù,<sup>6</sup> had secured most of the four provinces north of the Yellow River. The other, Cáo Cāo,<sup>7</sup> had gained the greater part of three provinces south of the Yellow River as well as custody of the Emperor of Hàn,<sup>8</sup> which he used to claim legitimacy for his actions as restoring the authority of the Hàn dynasty. By about 199 the two were openly preparing for a confrontation, and in 200 Yuán Shào began a southern campaign against his rival. Several accounts concerning Sūn Cè's death claim that he was preparing to take advantage of this confrontation to launch a surprise attack against Cáo Cāo's headquarters at Xǔ to seize custody of the Emperor of Hàn.<sup>9</sup>

That there should be so many accounts suggests that the belief in this plan was widespread, but there are also reasons to doubt this claim;<sup>10</sup> some details in the related accounts are contradicted by reliable accounts and certainly false, and the third century commentator Sūn Shèng objects that Sūn Cè could not have had the opportunity for such a northern campaign against Cáo Cāo's headquarters while he was already busy with the threat of Liú Biǎo's officer Huáng Zǔ<sup>11</sup> to the west and Cáo Cāo's officer Chén Dēng<sup>12</sup> to the direct north. Probably the belief that Sūn Cè was planning north against Xǔ was an exaggeration or misunderstanding of plans for a less ambitious northern campaign targeting Chén Dēng.

However, the accounts reflect real tensions between north and south and concerns in Cáo Cāo's camp that Sūn Cè might turn against them.<sup>13</sup> Cáo Cāo himself reportedly had, upon hearing of Sūn Cè's successes, remarked: "It will be difficult to with this mad dog pup fight."<sup>14</sup> To that end, Cáo Cāo had over the past few years attempted to handle Sūn Cè through careful diplomacy and subterfuge.

The two sides formed a nominal alliance about 197, when Sūn Cè broke with his former master Yuán Shù to reaffirm loyalty to the Hàn Emperor, under the control of Cáo Cāo. The Hàn Court under Cáo Cāo formally recognized Sūn Cè's authority in his conquered territory as Administrator of Kuàijī,<sup>15</sup> but it also sought to undermine him by sending another appointee, Chén Yǔ, to claim office as Administrator of Wú, in the heart of Sūn Cè's territory, over Sūn Cè's own appointed officer. Sūn Cè quickly defeated and drove away Chén Yǔ but otherwise kept the peace with Cáo Cāo, who made a concession by arranging for Sūn Cè to receive formal rank as a General. The Cáo and Sūn families further declared a marriage alliance,<sup>16</sup> and Cáo Cāo arranged for nominations for office on the behalf of Sūn Cè's younger brothers. However,

---

<sup>6</sup> Yuán Shào (d. 202) has biographies in SGZ 6 and HHS 74, which claim that he was a half-brother of Yuán Shù but had been adopted over to continue the line of his father's elder brother, leading to a rivalry over seniority in the family.

<sup>7</sup> Cáo Cāo (155 – 220) has annals in SGZ 1. See also de Crespigny *Imperial Warlord* for a detailed study of his life.

<sup>8</sup> This was Liú Xié (181 – 234), with annals in HHS 9. In 220, after a career of about thirty years where had been a powerless puppet, reigning (189 – 220) but never ruling, he formally abdicated the throne, ending the Hàn dynasty.

<sup>9</sup> The claim not only appears in Sūn Cè's biography in SGZ 46 and its attached accounts, it also appears in the annals in SGZ 1 and Guō Jiā's biography SGZ 14 and their attached accounts.

<sup>10</sup> A good summary of the objections is given in de Crespigny *Generals of the South* 197 – 199.

<sup>11</sup> Liú Biǎo (142 – 208), the major warlord based around the middle Yángzǐ, has biographies in SGZ 6 and HHS 74.

<sup>12</sup> Chén Dēng is attached to the biography of the warlord Lǚ Bù in SGZ 7.

<sup>13</sup> The account in SGZ 14 states that everyone was afraid Sūn Cè would take advantage to attack from the south, but Guō Jiā confidently replied that Sūn Cè would destroy himself with his own recklessness before that could happen.

<sup>14</sup> From *Wú lì* as annotated to SGZ 46.

<sup>15</sup> In the Hàn system, the Empire was divided into provinces (zhōu), provinces divided into prefectures (jùn), prefectures into counties (xiàn). The head of a prefecture was an Administrator (tàishǒu). About this time Sūn Cè had conquered the greater parts of three prefectures in Yáng Province: Kuàijī, Wú, and Dānyáng. I use "prefecture" over de Crespigny's "commandery" in imitation of the modern-day official translation convention of province, prefecture, county for the administrative divisions shěng, dì, xiàn of modern-day China.

<sup>16</sup> According to SGZ 46, Cáo Cāo's son Zhāng was pledged to a daughter of Sūn Cè's first cousin Bēn, and a daughter of a younger brother of Cáo Cāo was pledged Sūn Cè's younger brother Kuāng.

Cáo Cāo had also entrusted Chén Dēng, Chén Yǔ's cousin's son, with affairs in the east,<sup>17</sup> and by 200 Chén Dēng was continuing operations to undermine Sūn Cè by communicating with malcontents within Sūn Cè's territory in Wú prefecture. Indeed, Sūn Cè's final campaigns in 200 had been focused on putting down these local threats, which probably including the remnant forces of the former Administrator of Wú, Xǔ Gòng.

## Local Threats in the South

Sūn Cè had already defeated Xǔ Gòng in his conquest of Wú prefecture around 196-197, but Xǔ Gòng survived this initial confrontation and escaped. At some later stage, perhaps even during the pacification campaigns of 200, Xǔ Gòng finally fell into Sūn Cè's custody and, having previously written a petition to the Hàn Court against Sūn Cè, was executed. Xǔ Gòng's retainers fled and hid among the local population.

While waiting for supplies for his next planned campaign, Sūn Cè went hunting, and encountered three former retainers of Xǔ Gòng, who shot and wounded him. He died the night of May 5, 200.

However, accounts of two other major figures are also annotated to the account of Sūn Cè's death, Gāo Dài and Yú Jí.<sup>18</sup> The connection to Yú Jí is immediately obvious, as a ghost story preserved in *Sòushén jì* states that while being treated for his wounds, Sūn Cè saw the reflection of Yú Jí, whom he had previously executed, in a mirror, and the shock aggravated his injuries, leading to his death. The story of Gāo Dài appears to lack a direct connection at first,<sup>19</sup> but there are suspicious similarities with the story of Yú Jí, meaning they were likely compiled together for the sake of comparison. In both cases, Gāo Dài and Yú Jí offended Sūn Cè and were arrested,<sup>20</sup> and when large numbers of people made a show of pleading for them, Sūn Cè was angered further and executed them.

These accounts of Gāo Dài and Yú Jí thus reflect the challenges that Sūn Cè faced in establishing his own authority against popular local rivals and characterize Sūn Cè as very sensitive to such threats. Obviously not all of the conquests were willing to submit to their new master, and indeed Sūn Cè's chief opposition were powerful local clans that enjoyed deeper roots in the territory than he did.<sup>21</sup> The problem of relatively new senior leadership dealing with the conflicting interests of an entrenched middle leadership is perhaps a universal one, and not only did it eventually lead to Sūn Cè's death in the form of Xǔ Gòng's retainers, it remained an important problem that also defined the later history of the Sūn regime in Wú.<sup>22</sup>

---

<sup>17</sup> Around 197, Cáo Cāo had appointed Chén Dēng as Administrator of Guǎnglíng, the prefecture directly north of Wú.

<sup>18</sup> There is disagreement on whether the surname is Yú 于 or Gān 干. This paper uses an edition of SGZ that has Yú.

<sup>19</sup> The account of Gāo Dài mentions that he had supported Xǔ Gòng's predecessor Shèng Xiàn against Xǔ Gòng, but there is no further connection to Xǔ Gòng or to Sūn Cè's death.

<sup>20</sup> According to *Wúlù*, Gāo Dài had offended Sūn Cè by appearing patronizing in a scholarly discussion. *Jiāngbiǎo zhuàn* states that Sūn Cè was angered when most of his following suddenly abandoned a gathering under him to go pay respects to Yú Jí, while *Sòushén jì* instead states that Sūn Cè was angered by seeing his officers defer to Yú Jí during his preparations for a northern campaign against Cáo Cāo. The version in *Sòushén jì* notably connects the story of Yú Jí to the story of Sūn Cè's plans to attack Xǔ.

<sup>21</sup> Though the Sūn clan's ancestral home was in the same region, the Sūn clan was of far lesser lineage than the established great clans and had only come to prominence in the time of Sūn Jiān, and even this was through Sūn Jiān's military service in other parts of the Hàn Empire. As de Crespigny remarks in *Generals of the South*, 176: "There is clear contrast between Sun Ce's generous treatment of Zu Lang and Taishi Ci in Danyang in 198, and his firm repression of opposition when he was in Wu commandery in 196" and "Sun Ce felt that he could trust these two men, and he did not feel the same about his fellow-countrymen." Zū Láng and Tàishǐ Cì were surrendered enemies who had both almost killed Sūn Cè in battle, but been generously treated and trusted. Tàishǐ Cì has a biography in SGZ 49.

<sup>22</sup> See the discussion in de Crespigny, "Patterns in the later history of Wu (230-280)," *Generals of the South*, 479-493.

## Legacy

At the time of Sūn Cè's death, his son Sūn Shào was still young. The family enterprise would have to be entrusted with an older family member. Sūn Jiān had fathered four sons by his principal wife, of which Sūn Cè was the eldest. The third son Sūn Yì was about sixteen at the time, and said to have greatly resembled his brother Sūn Cè, but Sūn Cè instead entrusted authority to Sūn Quán, second son of Sūn Jiān and about eighteen at the time, despite the differences in their abilities and personalities.<sup>23</sup>

In the north, Cáo Cāo decisively defeated Yuán Shào at Guāndù in 200, and he spent the next seven years conquering all the north of the former Hàn Empire, while Sūn Quán consolidated his own position in the south and focused on westward expansion up the Yángzǐ. In 208, Cáo Cāo turned south and called for Sūn Quán's surrender, whereupon Sūn Quán decided on open opposition and defeated Cáo Cāo's first advance at Chìbì.<sup>24</sup> Though Cáo Cāo would continue to launch several major offensives against Sūn Quán over the next decade, he never broke Sūn Quán's defensive line on the Yángzǐ river, but neither could Sūn Quán break Cáo Cāo's defensive line on the Huái river valley. In other directions both sides were more successful in expanding their power,<sup>25</sup> but the north-south divide would be maintained between their domains for nearly a century, and after a comparatively brief unification under Western Jìn, the divide would appear again for another three centuries during Eastern Jìn and the Southern-Northern Dynasties period.

But it did not necessarily have to be this way. Had Sūn Cè lived longer, events might have developed in a very different fashion, and it is perhaps for this reason that there should be so many stories surrounding his sudden death. Not only are the stories about the conflict with Cáo Cāo, or about Sūn Cè's sensitivities to the ever-present danger of local challenges to the Sūn clan's authority, they also wonder at the counterfactuals what-ifs. If Sūn Cè had lived longer, perhaps Cáo Cāo would not have been as free to conquer the north and would have been forced into a direct confrontation with the south at an earlier date. If Sūn Cè had lived longer, perhaps he would have made decisions different from the ones that Sūn Quán made in dealing with local threats to the Sūn clan's rule, that could have resulted in stronger or weaker rule.<sup>26</sup> And of course, had Sūn Cè lived longer, all sorts of other stories would have gathered around him, and history would perhaps have remembered him quite differently.<sup>27</sup> The fifth of May was thus a pivotal day in the history of later Hàn and the Three Kingdoms, an example of how the life and death of one man can alter the destiny of an Empire.

---

<sup>23</sup> Sūn Yì (184 – 203) has a biography in SGZ 51, where an annotation from *Diǎnlüè* makes the claim that the senior officials favored entrusting him as Sūn Cè's successor due to their similarity in nature. According to SGZ 46, as Sūn Cè lay dying and entrusted his authority Sūn Quán, he gave a moving evaluation on their differing talents.

<sup>24</sup> See de Crespigny *Generals of the South*, chapter 4, "To the Red Cliffs: Sun Quan 200-208," 213 – 274.

<sup>25</sup> Both Cáo Cāo and Sūn Quán would alternate between attacking each other and expanding in other directions. Cáo Cāo led successful western campaigns to restore control over the Wèi river valley, while Sūn Quán expanded west into the middle Yángzǐ river valley and south into the Pearl river valley and Red river valley.

<sup>26</sup> As an example, the appraisal at the end of SGZ 52 considers the later career of the statesmen Zhāng Zhāo, who had been closely trusted by Sūn Cè but in his later years had quarreled with Sūn Quán and thus been excluded from the highest ranks of Sūn Quán's Court, and remarks: "from this it is clear that Quán did not match Cè."

<sup>27</sup> One may note that before his enthronement, Sūn Hào (243 – 284), grandson of Sūn Quán and last Emperor of Wú, had once been appraised positively as resembling Sūn Cè. After his enthronement however Sūn Hào eventually developed a reputation for cruelty and brutality due to his bloody suppression of challenges to his authority.

## TRANSLATION

Jiàn'ān Fifth Year [200],<sup>1</sup> Excellency Cáo [Cāo] with Yuán Shào mutually resisted at Guāndù,<sup>2</sup> [Sūn] Cè secretly wished to attack Xǔ, to welcome the Hàn Emperor, (1) secretly drilled troops, and deployed various officers. He had not yet set out, when it happened that he was by former Wú prefecture Administrator Xǔ Gòng's retainers killed. Before this, [Sūn] Cè killed [Xǔ] Gòng, [Xǔ] Gòng's young son with the retainers fled and hid by the Jiāng's bank.<sup>3</sup> [Sūn] Cè alone rode and set out, suddenly with the retainers encountered, the retainers struck and injured [Sūn] Cè, (2) the wounds were extreme, and he requested Zhāng Zhāo<sup>4</sup> and the rest and said: "The central states are just in chaos; with Wú and Yuè's armies,<sup>5</sup> and the three rivers' defenses, it is sufficient to watch for success and failure. Your excellencies must well assist my younger brother!" He called [Sūn] Quán<sup>6</sup> and girdled him with seal and ribbon, and said: "To raise the Jiāng's east's armies, decide opportunities between two battle lines, with all Under Heaven strive for mastery, you do not match me. To raise worthies and appoint the able, so each exhaust their heart, and thus protect the Jiāng's east, I do not match you." Reaching night he died, at the time his years twenty-six.<sup>7</sup> (3)

建安五年，曹公與袁紹相拒於官渡，策陰欲襲許，迎漢帝，〔一〕密治兵，部署諸將。未發，會為故吳郡太守許貢客所殺。先是，策殺貢，貢小子與客亡匿江邊。策單騎出，卒與客遇，客擊傷策。〔二〕創甚，請張昭等謂曰：「中國方亂，夫以吳、越之眾，三江之固，足以觀成敗。公等善相吾弟！」呼權佩以印綬，謂曰：「舉江東之眾，決機於兩陳之間，與天下爭衡，卿不如我；舉賢任能，各盡其心，以保江東，我不知卿。」至夜卒，時年二十六。〔三〕

- (1) *Wúlù* [Notes of Wú] states: At the time there was Gāo Dài, secluded in Yúyáo, [Sūn] Cè ordered to send out as envoy Kuàijī Deputy<sup>8</sup> Lù Zhāo to welcome him, [Sūn] Cè humbled himself and waited. He heard [Gāo Dài] was good with the *Zuǒ Zhuàn*,<sup>9</sup> and therefore himself amused and read it, wishing to with him discuss and talk. Someone said to him: "Gāo Dài believes that you General are only outstanding in warfare and nothing more, without talent for literary scholarship. If you with him discuss the *Zhuàn* and he perhaps says he does not know something, then my words [here] will be prescient." He also said to [Gāo] Dài: "General Sūn as a man hates those that surpass him. If every time he asks something, you then say you do not know, this will accord with his wishes and that is all. If in every case you debate meanings, this certainly will be dangerous." [Gāo] Dài believed this was correct, and when he with [Sūn Cè] discussed the *Zhuàn*, sometimes he would answer he did not know. [Sūn] Cè indeed was angry, believing it making light of him, and therefore imprisoned him. Intimate friends and the time's people all out in the open sat to for him plead. [Sūn] Cè ascended a tower, looked out and saw them crowded for several lǐ. [Sūn] Cè hated that [Gāo Dài] had won the masses' hearts, and therefore killed him. [Gāo] Dài appellation Kǒngwén was a Wú prefecture man. By nature he was intelligent and perceptive, thought little of wealth and valued righteousness. His friends and elites selected out his uniqueness, fetching him from the not

<sup>1</sup> The counting of years was organized by so-called "Year Names" (niánhào), stylistic mottos issued by the reigning sovereign. Jiàn'ān can be interpreted as "to establish peace."

<sup>2</sup> For an account of the Guāndù campaign, see the annals in SGZ 1 and the biographies of Yuán Shào in SGZ 6 and HHS 74. See also the discussion in de Crespigny in *Imperial Warlord*, chapter 3 "To Battle at Guandu," 97 – 152.

<sup>3</sup> Jiāng is the old name for the Yángzǐ river. In modern times the word jiāng is often used to refer to rivers in general.

<sup>4</sup> Zhāng Zhāo (156 – 236) has a biography in SGZ 52

<sup>5</sup> Wú and Yué are toponyms for the area about the lower Yǎngzǐ river and Hángzhōu bay.

<sup>6</sup> Sūn Quán (182 – 252), younger brother of Sūn Cè, has a biography in SGZ 47.

<sup>7</sup> In the traditional reckoning of age, a person's years of age started at one at birth and increased by one at each New Year. Someone aged twenty-six years in traditional reckoning would be twenty-five years old in modern reckoning.

<sup>8</sup> The Deputy (chéng) was the main assistant to the Administrator (tàishǒu) of a prefecture (jùn).

<sup>9</sup> The *Zuǒ Zhuàn* was a canonical commentary of the classic history *Chūnqiū*, attributed to the scholar Zuǒ Qīumíng.

yet famed, his friends were eight men, all the era's outstanding eminent. Administrator Shèng Xiàn believed him of highest caliber, nominated him as Filial and Incorrupt. Xǔ Gòng came to govern the prefecture, [Gāo] Dài led [Shèng] Xiàn to avoid troubles to Xǔ Zhāo's family,<sup>10</sup> and sought rescue from Táo Qiān.<sup>11</sup> [Táo] Qiān had not yet sent rescue, [Gāo] Dài was withered and haggard and wept blood, water and broth not entering his mouth. [Táo] Qiān was moved by his loyalty and integrity, having Shēn Bāoxū's righteousness,<sup>12</sup> and agreed to for them send out the army, writing a letter for [Xǔ] Gòng. [Gāo] Dài obtained [Táo] Qiān's letter and with it returned, but [Xǔ] Gòng had already imprisoned his mother. Wú people large and small all for his danger were horrified, believing as [Xǔ] Gòng always hated him, going he would certainly meet with harm. [Gāo] Dài said that if there is a ruler then serve the ruler, and moreover his mother was in prison, it was the time that he must go, and if he was able to enter and meet, the matter would itself be resolved. Therefore he sent letter explaining himself, [Xǔ] Gòng then with him mutually met. He was talented in speech and nimble and shrewd, good at explaining himself and apologizing, and [Xǔ] Gòng at once sent out his mother. When [Gāo] Dài was about to meet [Xǔ] Gòng, he told his friends Zhāng Yǔn and Shēn Mǐn to in advance prepare a boat, as [Xǔ] Gòng would certainly regret it, and then pursue them. Going out then at once he led his mother to ride the boat on changed route and fled. [Xǔ] Gòng at once sent men to pursue them, ordering the pursuers that if they reached the boat, if they were on the Jiāng then kill them, if they had already crossed then stop. The envoys with [Gāo] Dài were on wrong road, and therefore he escaped. At the time he was executed [by Sūn Cè], his years were over thirty.

- *Jiāngbiǎo zhuàn* [Biographies Beyond the Jiāng] states: At the time there was a Dào master Lángyè's Yú Jí, formerly residing in the east, going and coming about Wú and Kuài[jī], established vitality house, burning incense and reading Dào books, manufactured charmed water to treat illness, and of Wú and Kuài's people many served him. [Sūn] Cè was once at the prefecture city gate tower's top, gathering the various officers and guest retainers, [Yú] Jí then in splendid attire and carrying a small case, lacquered and painted, called as a celestial man's spade, walked past below the gate. Of the various officers and guest retainers two-thirds went down the tower to welcome and pay respects to him, the ones handling the retainers prohibited and shouted but could not stop them. [Sūn] Cè at once arrested him. Those that served them, all sent their women to enter to meet [Sūn] Cè's mother, pleading to save him. The mother said to [Sūn] Cè: "Master Yú also assists the army and creates fortunes, medically protects the officers and soldiers, you cannot kill him." [Sūn] Cè said: "This man is a witch, able to dazzle and confuse the masses' hearts, from afar causing the various officers to no longer mutually observe the rites of ruler and servant, completely leaving me to descend the tower to pay respects to him, he cannot be not eliminated." The various officers again signed names to explain matters to beg for him, [Sūn] Cè said: "In the past Nányáng's Zhāng Jīn was Jiāo Province Inspector, abandoned former sacred canons and teachings, abolished the Hàn House's laws, always wearing purple-red scarf on head, drumming zither and burning incense, reading evil custom Dào books, saying it was to help cultivation, in the end he was by the southern Yí killed. This deeply is without benefit; you sirs yet do not yet understand and that is all. Now this man is already in the ghost registry, do not again waste paper and brush." Then he promptly beheaded him, hanging the head in the market. Those that had served him, yet did not say he was dead but said he had left his body, and resumed offering sacrifices and seeking fortune.

<sup>10</sup> Xǔ Gòng took control of Wú prefecture from Shèng Xiàn around 194, and Shèng Xiàn fled in fear of him. Perhaps ironically, Xǔ Gòng would later himself take refuge with Xǔ Zhāo after being defeated by Sūn Cè.

<sup>11</sup> Táo Qiān (132 – 194) has biographies in SGZ 8 and HHS 73.

<sup>12</sup> Shēn Bāoxū was a minister of Chǔ who went to plead for help from the state of Qín when Chǔ was in danger. See the Chǔ Hereditary House in SJ 40.

- *Zhìlín* [Forest of Records] states: At first in Emperor Shùn’s time,<sup>13</sup> Lángyè’s Gōng Chóng visited the palace to present the divine book that his teacher Yú Jí’s obtained at Qǔyáng’s spring water’s top, white silk and vermilion borders, called *Tàipíng Qīnglíng Dào*, altogether over one hundred juàn. Emperor Shùn reaching to Jiàn’ān was fifty to sixty years, Yú Jí at the time was nearly already a hundred years, when years are octogenarian to nonagenarian, by ritual do not apply punishments. Also Heaven’s Son when traveling and hunting, asks for those of a hundred years, then goes to meet them, respecting tooth [age] with close favor, this is the sagely ruler’s utmost teaching. [Yú] Jí’s crime did not reach death, but cruelly applying strong punishment, this then was wrongful execution, and not to be praised. [I] Xǐ<sup>14</sup> verified that King Huán’s [Sūn Cè’s] death, was on Jiàn’ān Fifth Year Fourth Moon Fourth Day [220 May 5]. At the time Cáo [Cāo] and Yuán [Shào] were mutually attacking, and did not yet have victory or defeat. Citing Xiàhóu [Dūn] Yuánràng’s<sup>15</sup> letter to Shí Wēizé, after Yuán Shào’s defeat, the letter says: “Award Sūn Bēn<sup>16</sup> with Chángshā, occupy Zhāng Jīn with Líng[líng] and Guì[yáng].” This means King Huán previously perished, and Zhāng Jīn later died, it cannot mutually coincide, and as an example speak of the meaning of [Zhāng] Jīn’s death.
- Your Servant Sōngzhī cites: Tàikāng Eighth Year [287], Guǎng Province Chief Central Rectifier<sup>17</sup> Wáng Fàn presented *Jiāo-Guǎng Èrzhōu Chūnqiū*.<sup>18</sup> Jiàn’ān Sixth Year [201], Zhāng Jīn was still Jiāo Province Governor. *Jiāngbiǎo zhuàn*’s falseness is as *Zhìlín* has said.
- *Sòushén jì* [In Search of the Supernatural] states: [Sūn] Cè wished to cross the Jiāng to attack Xǔ, and with [Yú] Jí together traveled. At the time there was great drought, where they were severely dry. [Sūn] Cè pressed the various officers and soldiers to go quickly draw boats, once he personally early went out to command and decide, and saw of the officers and officials many were at [Yú] Jí’s behest, [Sūn] Cè because of this was furious, saying: “Am I not as good as Yú Jí, that you first go to attend to him?” Then he arrested [Yú] Jí, [Yú] Jí arrived, and huffing he asked him: “There is drought without rain, the roads difficult and rough, not timely obtaining passage, and therefore I personally early go out, but you do not share in my worries and griefs, securely sitting in boat making ghost trinkets, ruining my divisions and squads, now I will eliminate you.” He ordered men to bind and install him on the ground to expose him, having him plead for rain, and if he were able to move the heavens and at noon it rained, then he would be pardoned, but if not then he would be executed. Very soon cloud and mist above gathered, concentrating and uniting,<sup>19</sup> reaching to noon, great rain gathered and arrived, streams and gorges full and overflowing. The officers and soldiers were joyous, believing [Yú] Jí certainly would meet with pardon, and together went to congratulate and comfort. [Sūn] Cè therefore killed him. The officers and soldiers grieved and pitied, together collecting his body. At night, suddenly there rose a cloud to cover it, the next morning going to look, they did not know where it was.

<sup>13</sup> Emperor Shùn (r. 125 – 144) is the posthumous name of Liú Bǎo (115 – 144), with annals in HHS 6.

<sup>14</sup> The fourth century scholar and astronomer Yú Xǐ (281 – 356) was the main author and compiler of the *Zhìlín*.

<sup>15</sup> Xiàhóu Dūn (d. 220) has a biography in SGZ 9.

<sup>16</sup> Sūn Bēn, a first cousin of Sūn Cè, has a biography in SGZ 51.

<sup>17</sup> Chief Central Rectifiers (dà zhōngzhèng) were senior officials in charge of managing recommendations and recruitment into the Imperial Bureaucracy.

<sup>18</sup> The term chūnqiū, literally “springs and autumns,” is used for chronicle style histories, most famously the *Chūnqiū*, which covers 722 – 481 BC. Wáng Fàn composed his *Jiāo-Guǎng Èrzhōu Chūnqiū* “Chronicles of the Two Provinces Jiāo and Guǎng” as a history of the far south, which he felt had been neglected in his contemporary Sīmǎ Biǎo’s history *Jiǔzhōu Chūnqiū* “Chronicles of Nine Provinces” covering the end of Hàn.

<sup>19</sup> The term used here is an idiomatic phrase “fū cùn ér hé,” which appears in the *Gōngyáng zhuàn*. Fū and cùn were ancient units of length, cùn for the width of one finger, fū for the width of four fingers. The phrase came to be associated with describing the gathering of clouds before heavy rain.

- Citing *Jiāngbiǎo zhuàn* and *Sōushén jì* the Yú Jí matters are not the same, it is unclear which is correct.

〔一〕 吳錄曰：時有高岱者，隱於餘姚，策命出使會稽丞陸昭逆之，策虛己候焉。聞其善左傳，乃自玩讀，欲與論講。或謂之曰：「高岱以將軍但英武而已，無文學之才，若與論傳而或云不知者，則某言符矣。」又謂岱曰：「孫將軍為人，惡勝己者，若每問，當言不知，乃合意耳。如皆辨義，此必危殆。」岱以為然，及與論傳，或答不知。策果怒，以為輕己，乃囚之。知交及時人皆露坐為請。策登樓，望見數里中填滿。策惡其收眾心，遂殺之。岱字孔文，吳郡人也。受性聰達，輕財貴義。其友士拔奇，取於未顯，所友八人，皆世之英偉也。太守盛憲以為上計，舉孝廉。許貢來領郡，岱將憲避難於許昭家，求救於陶謙。謙未即救，岱憔悴泣血，水漿不入口。謙感其忠壯，有申包胥之義，許為出軍，以書與貢。岱得謙書以還，而貢已囚其母。吳人大小皆為危竦，以貢宿忿，往必見害。岱言在君則為君，且母在牢獄，期於當往，若得入見，事自當解。遂通書自白，貢即與相見。才辭敏捷，好自陳謝，貢登時出其母。岱將見貢，語友人張允、沈〈日昏〉令豫具船，以貢必悔，當追逐之。出便將母乘船易道而逃。貢須臾遣人追之，令追者若及於船，江上便殺之，已過則止。使與岱錯道，遂免。被誅時，年三十餘。江表傳曰：時有道士琅邪于吉，先寓居東方，往來吳會，立精舍，燒香讀道書，制作符水以治病，吳會人多事之。策嘗於郡城門樓上，集會諸將賓客，吉乃盛服杖小函，漆畫之，名為仙人鐔，趨度門下。諸將賓客三分之二下樓迎拜之，掌賓者禁呵不能止。策即令收之。諸事之者，悉使婦人入見策母，請救之。母謂策曰：「于先生亦助軍作福，醫護將士，不可殺之。」策曰：「此子妖妄，能幻惑眾心，遠使諸將不復相顧君臣之禮，盡委策下樓拜之，不可不除也。」諸將復連名通白事陳乞之，策曰：「昔南陽張津為交州刺史，舍前聖典訓，廢漢家法律，嘗著絳帕頭，鼓琴燒香，讀邪俗道書，云以助化，卒為南夷所殺。此甚無益，諸君但未悟耳。今此子已在鬼籙，勿復費紙筆也。」即催斬之，縣首於市。諸事之者，尚不謂其死而云尸解焉，復祭祀求福。志林曰：初順帝時，琅邪宮崇詣闕上師于吉所得神書於曲陽泉水上，白素朱界，號太平青領道，凡百餘卷。順帝至建安中，五六十歲，于吉是時近已百年，年在耄悼，禮不加刑。又天子巡狩，問百年者，就而見之，敬齒以親愛，聖王之至教也。吉罪不及死，而暴加酷刑，是乃謬誅，非所以為美也。喜推考桓王之薨，建安五年四月四日。是時曹、袁相攻，未有勝負。案夏侯元讓與石威則書，袁紹破後也。書云：「授孫贛以長沙，業張津以零、桂。」此為桓王於前亡，張津於後死，不得相讓，譬言津之死意矣。臣松之案：太康八年，廣州大中正王範上交廣二州春秋。建安六年，張津猶為交州牧。江表傳之虛如志林所云。搜神記曰：策欲渡江襲許，與吉俱行。時大旱，所在熇厲。策催諸將士使速引船，或身自早出督切，見將吏多在吉許，策因此激怒，言：「我為不如于吉邪，而先趨務之？」便使收吉。至，呵問之曰：「天旱不雨，道塗艱澀，不時得過，故自早出，而卿不同憂戚，安坐船中作鬼物態，敗吾部伍，今當相除。」令人縛置地上暴之，使請雨，若能感天日中雨者，當原赦，不爾行誅。俄而雲氣上蒸，膚寸而合，比至日中，大雨總至，溪澗盈溢。將士喜悅，以為吉必見原，並往慶慰。策遂殺之。將士哀惜，共藏其尸。天夜，忽更興雲覆之；明旦往視，不知所存。案江表傳、搜神記于吉事不同，未詳孰是。

- (2) *Jiāngbiǎo zhuàn* states: Guǎnglíng Administrator Chén Dēng governed Shèyáng, [Chén] Dēng was [Chén] Yǔ's elder cousin's son. [Sūn] Cè previously campaigned west, [Chén] Dēng secretly again sent envoys to sow discontent, giving seals and ribbons to Yán Báihǔ's remnants,<sup>20</sup> scheming to be a rear danger, to avenge the disgrace of [Chén] Yǔ meeting defeat. [Sūn] Cè returned, and again suppressed [Chén] Dēng. The army arrived at Dāntú, and waited for transported provisions.

<sup>20</sup> Yán Báihǔ was a local leader in Wú who had opposed Sūn Cè. Báihǔ, literally “white tiger,” is not a personal name but a stylistic name he went by, a practice common among bandit leaders.

[Sūn] Cè by nature enjoyed hunting, and led infantry and cavalry of several to go out. [Sūn] Cè hurried in pursuit of deer, the horse he rode was elite and spirited, the accompanying cavalry was cut off and could not reach. Previously, Wú prefecture Administrator Xǔ Gòng had sent up memorial to the Hàn Emperor that said: “Sūn Cè is valiant and heroic, with Xiàng Jí<sup>21</sup> mutually resembling, it is appropriate to apply nobility and favor, to summon him back to the capital city. If he is given Imperial Order he cannot not return, if released outside he will certainly be the era’s misfortune.” [Sūn] Cè’s scout officials obtained [Xǔ] Gòng’s memorial, with it showed [Sūn] Cè. [Sūn] Cè invited [Xǔ] Gòng to mutually meet, and about it accused [Xǔ] Gòng. [Xǔ] Gòng said there was no memorial, [Sūn] Cè at once ordered warriors to bind and kill him. [Xǔ] Gòng’s slaves and retainers hid among the people, wishing to for [Xǔ] Gòng take revenge. On the hunting day, suddenly there were three men that were [Xǔ] Gòng’s retainers. [Sūn] Cè asked: “Who are you?” They answered: “We are Hàn Dāng’s troops,<sup>22</sup> here shooting deer and that is all.” [Sūn] Cè said: “[Hàn] Dāng’s troops I all recognize; I have never seen you.” Therefore he shot one man, who at the bow string twang was felled. The remaining two men were terrified, and at once raised bow and shot [Sūn] Cè, striking his cheek. The rear cavalry arrived, and all stabbed and killed them.

- *Jiūzhōu Chūnqīū* [Chronicles of Nine Provinces] states: [Sūn] Cè heard Excellency Cáo [Cāo] was campaigning north against Liǔchéng, and completely raised the Jiāng’s south’s armies, declaring himself Marshal-in-Chief, about to go north to attack Xǔ, relying on his valor, going without preparations, and therefore reached disaster.
- Sūn Shèng’s *Yítóng píng* [Appraisals of Differences and Similarities] states: All these several books, each have faults. Sūn Cè though had authority spreading beyond the Jiāng, overall having six prefectures,<sup>23</sup> however Huáng Zǔ was to his upstream, Chén Dēng sowing discontent among his heart and belly, and moreover in deep and rugged terrain were strong clans, not yet completely submitted, Cáo [Cāo] and Yuán [Shào] like tigers fought, their power overturning mountains and seas, how could [Sūn] Cè leisurely from afar campaign about Rǔ and Yǐng, and move the Emperor to Wú and Yuè? This would be a mediocre man’s reflection and observation, so all the more for [Sūn] Cè’s understanding of the situation. Also citing Yuán Shào in Jiàn’ān Fifth Year [200] reached Líyáng, but [Sūn] Cè in the fourth moon encountered harm, and yet the records say [Sūn] Cè heard Excellency Cáo with [Yuán] Shào mutually resisted at Guāndù, it is an error. The words of attacking [Chén] Dēng, can be confirmed. Also *Jiāngbiǎo zhuàn* says [Sūn] Cè all recognized Hàn Dāng’s army soldiers, suspected this was deception, and then shot and killed one man. If in the Three Armies<sup>24</sup> officers and soldiers there were those newly attached, [Sūn] Cè was the chief general, how could he be able to recognize them all? To not recognize someone and then shoot and kill them is not reasonable. Also [Sūn] Cè was killed in the Fifth Year [200], the Liǔchéng campaign was in the Twelfth Year [207], *Jiūzhōu Chūnqīū*’s abnormal mistakes are incredibly extreme.
- Your Servant Sōngzhī cites: *Fù-zǐ* also says when Excellency Cáo [Cāo] was campaigning against Liǔchéng, he was about to attack Xǔ. Recording accounts like this, how can it be this negligent? However what Sūn Shèng ridicules, is not yet completely right. Huáng Zǔ was just by [Sūn] Cè defeated, his spirit not yet returned, and moreover Liú Biǎo ruler and his subjects by nature were without intentions to conquer, though he was upstream, how could he plan against Wú and Kuài? [Sūn] Cè in this rising, reasonably should first be to deal with Chén Dēng, but raising troops where

<sup>21</sup> Xiàng Jí (232 BC – 202 BC), more famously known as Xiàng Yǔ, has annals in SJ 7 and biography in HS 31.

<sup>22</sup> Hàn Dāng (d. 227) was an officer who served under Sūn Jiān, Sūn Cè, and Sūn Quán, with biography in SGZ 55.

<sup>23</sup> These were Wú, Kuàijī, Dānyáng, Yùzhāng, Lújiāng and Lúlíng. The first five were relatively long-established prefectures in Hàn’s system listed in the base text of treatises on administrative divisions in HHS, while Lúlíng prefecture was established about 194, divided out from the southern part of Yùzhāng.

<sup>24</sup> In ancient Zhōu ideals, Heaven’s Son maintained Six Armies, large vassals maintained three, the next two, and small vassals one. Consequently, the term Three Armies came to refer to a region or warlord’s military forces.

he was, was not limited to [Chén] Dēng and nothing more. At the time the strong clans and valiant leaders, Zǔ Láng and Yán [Bái]hǔ's sort, had been taken and exterminated already completely, the remnant Shānyuè, overall how were they worth worrying over? That being the case what [Sūn] Cè planned, cannot be said to be inopportune. Supposing if [Sūn] Cè's ambitions were obtained and followed, great power in his hands, between the Huái and Sì anywhere could be the capital, why must all his ambitions stay beyond the Jiāng, that he should move the Emperor to Yáng and Yuè?<sup>25</sup> According to *Wèi Wǔ jì* [SGZ 1], Emperor Wǔ [Cáo Cāo] in Jiàn'ān Fourth Year [199] had already set out and garrisoned Guāndù, this was before [Sūn] Cè had died, for a long time he with Yuán Shào crossed weapons, then what [Sān] *Guó zhì* says is not erroneous. Xǔ Gòng's retainers, were petty men without fame, but were able to be moved and remember encountering kindness, facing righteousness forget their lives, in the end vigorously acting, having resemblance to ancient martyrs. The *Shī* says: "Gentlemen have noble plans, petty men with them join." [Xǔ] Gòng's retainers were like this.

〔二〕江表傳曰：廣陵太守陳登治射陽，登即瑀之從兄子也。策前西征，登陰復遣間使，以印綬與嚴白虎餘黨，圖為後害，以報瑀見破之辱。策歸，復討登。軍到丹徒，須待運糧。策性好獵，將步騎數出。策驅馳逐鹿，所乘馬精駿，從騎絕不能及。初，吳郡太守許貢上表於漢帝曰：「孫策驍雄，與項籍相似，宜加貴寵，召還京邑。若被詔不得不還，若放於外必作世患。」策候吏得貢表，以示策。策請貢相見，以責讓貢。貢辭無表，策即令武士絞殺之。貢奴客潛民間，欲為貢報讎。獵日，卒有三人即貢客也。策問：「爾等何人？」答云：「是韓當兵，在此射鹿耳。」策曰：「當兵吾皆識之，未嘗見汝等。」因射一人，應弦而倒。餘二人怖急，便舉弓射策，中頰。後騎尋至，皆刺殺之。九州春秋曰：策聞曹公北征柳城，悉起江南之眾，自號大司馬，將北襲許，恃其勇，行不設備，故及於難。孫盛異同評曰：凡此數書，各有所失。孫策雖威行江外，略有六郡，然黃祖乘其上流，陳登間其心腹，且深險疆宗，未盡歸復，曹、袁虎爭，勢傾山海，策豈暇遠師汝、潁，而遷帝於吳、越哉？斯蓋庸人之所鑿見，況策達於事勢者乎？又案袁紹以建安五年至黎陽，而策以四月遇害，而志云策聞曹公與紹相拒於官渡，謬矣。伐登之言，為有證也。又江表傳說策悉識韓當軍士，疑此為詐，便射殺一人。夫三軍將士或有新附，策為大將，何能悉識？以所不識，便射殺之，非其論也，又策見殺在五年，柳城之役在十二年，九州春秋乖錯尤甚矣。臣松之案：傳子亦云曹公征柳城，將襲許。記述若斯，何其疏哉！然孫盛所譏，未為悉是。黃祖始被策破，魂氣未反，（但）〔且〕劉表君臣本無兼并之志，雖在上流，何辦規擬吳會？策之此舉，理應先圖陳登，但舉兵所在，不止登而已。于時疆宗驍帥，祖郎、嚴虎之徒，禽滅已盡，所餘山越，蓋何足慮？然則策之所規，未可謂之不暇也。若使策志獲從，大權在手，淮、泗之間，所在皆可都，何必畢志江外，其當遷帝於揚、越哉？案魏武紀，武帝以建安四年已出屯官渡，乃策未死之前，久與袁紹交兵，則國志所云不為謬也。許貢客。無聞之小人，而能感識恩遇，臨義忘生，卒然奮發，有侔古烈矣。詩云：「君子有徽猷，小人與屬。」貢客其有焉。

- (3) *Wǔlì* states: [Sūn] Cè had been wounded, the doctors said it could be treated, if he well managed and protected himself, and for a hundred days did not move. [Sūn] Cè drew a mirror and looked at himself, and said to his left and right attendants: "With a face like this, how can I again establish achievements and set affairs?" He hammered his seat with great exertion, his wounds all split open, and that night he died.
- *Sōushén jì* states: [Sūn] Cè had killed Yú Jí, every time he alone sat, he seemed to see [Yú] Jí at his left and right, and his thoughts deeply loathed this, believing it strange. Later his treated wounds

<sup>25</sup> Péi Sōngzhī's argument is that rather than move the Emperor to the lower Yángzǐ river valley in the far southeast, which as Sūn Shèng had pointed out would have been very difficult, Sūn Cè could have instead shifted his own powerbase into the Huái river valley.

were almost healed, but he drew a mirror and looked at himself, and saw [Yú] Jí in the mirror, turned his head but did not see him, it was like this twice and thrice, and therefore he struck the mirror and greatly shouted, his wounds all broke open, and immediately he died.

〔三〕 吳歷曰：策既被創，醫言可治，當好自將護，百日勿動。策引鏡自照，謂左右曰：「面如此，尚可復建功立事乎？」椎几大奮，創皆分裂，其夜卒。搜神記曰：策既殺于吉，每獨坐，彷彿見吉在左右，意深惡之，頗有失常。後治創方差，而引鏡自照，見吉在鏡中，顧而弗見，如是再三，因撲鏡大叫，創皆崩裂，須臾而死。

[Sūn] Quán claimed honored title [as Emperor, 229], giving posthumous name on [Sūn] Cè as King Huán of Chángshā,<sup>26</sup> enfeoffing his son [Sūn] Shào as Lord of Wú, later changing fief to Lord of Shàngyú.<sup>27</sup> [Sūn] Shào died, his son [Sūn] Fèng succeeded. In Sūn Hào's time,<sup>28</sup> false report said [Sūn] Fèng was about to be enthroned, and he was put to death.

權稱尊號，追諡策曰長沙桓王，封子紹為吳侯，後改封上虞侯。紹卒，子奉嗣。孫皓時，訛言謂奉當立，誅死。

Appraisal States: Sūn Jiān was valorous and sincere stalwart and resolute, from orphaned and humble origins left his mark, encouraged [Zhāng] Wēn to kill [Dǒng] Zhuó,<sup>29</sup> the mountains and mounds blocked, he had loyal integrity's fierceness. [Sūn] Cè had heroic spirit and outstanding ability, his ferociousness crowning the era, observing the special and selecting out the unique, his ambition towering the central plains. However both were reckless and hot-tempered, ruining self and reaching destruction. Moreover cutting away and occupying the Jiāng's east, was [Sūn] Cè's foundation, but [Sūn] Quán's honor and esteem did not reach him, his son stopped at a Lord's rank, by righteousness this was ungenerous. (1)

評曰：孫堅勇摯剛毅，孤微發跡，導溫戮卓，山陵杜塞，有忠壯之烈。策英氣傑濟，猛銳冠世，覽奇取異，志陵中夏。然皆輕佻果躁，隕身致敗。且割據江東，策之基兆也，而權尊崇未至，子止侯爵，於義儉矣。〔一〕

- (1) Sūn Shèng states: The Sūn clan brothers all were brilliant and skilled separate from the crowds. The beginning foundations and establishing affairs, were due to [Sūn] Cè. On the day facing his own end, he entrusted command to [Sūn] Quán. Within intention and spirit, yet there is cutting throat [out of devotion], so all the more in the sincere love of family bonds and outstanding reflections of towering attainment, how can stingy title be given on the past, violating original feeling's utmost truth? Or was it instead the distant consideration of calculating emptying and filling, and caution in naming devices? The standardizing of foundations and settling of names, is the state's great defense, to put an end to doubts and second thoughts, a good practice to eliminate disputes. Therefore Lǚ [Duke] Yīn esteemed righteousness, in the end reaching Yǔfù's disaster;<sup>30</sup>

<sup>26</sup> As a posthumous name, Huán has connotations of opening and developing new territory.

<sup>27</sup> One might compare and contrast this to the conduct of Emperor Guāng-Wǔ (r. 25 – 57) of Later Hàn, Liú Xiù (5 BC – 57). The initial effort to restore the Hàn dynasty had been led by Liú Xiù's elder brother Liú Yǎn (d. 23), and Liú Xiù continued the enterprise after his brother was killed. After Liú Xiù became Emperor, he enfeoffed his brother's eldest son as King of Qí and gave posthumous title on his elder brother as King Wǔ of Qí. See the annals of Guāng-Wǔ in HHS 1 and the biographies of Liú Yǎn and his successors in HHS 14.

<sup>28</sup> Sūn Hào (243 – 284), grandson of Sūn Quán and last ruler of Wú, has biography in SGZ 48.

<sup>29</sup> Dǒng Zhuó (d. 192) has biographies in SGZ 6 and HHS 72.

<sup>30</sup> At the death of his father Duke Huī of Lǚ in 723 BC, the intended heir was the future Duke Huán, but due to his young age his elder half-brother Duke Yīn was established as an interim ruler. When Duke Huán grew up, Yǔfù encouraged Duke Yīn to kill Duke Huán to remain in power, but Duke Yīn refused; Yǔfù feared Duke Huán would

Sòng [Duke] Xuān harbored benevolence, finally there was Duke Shāng's tragedy.<sup>31</sup> Both hearts harbored small goods, but did not reach distant planning; they sought praise in their own years, but did not consider their legacies. It can be called thinking little of a thousand chariot state,<sup>32</sup> approaching the way and yet not reaching it. The Sūn clan was amid disturbance, obtaining exertion for their widespread ambitions, the enterprise was not a foundation of accumulated virtue, the state was without a boulder's firmness. If by power it is unified then the blessings can be ended, if feelings depart then in disaster and chaos dust will rise. How can one not guard carefully against uncertainty, and consider troubles of the yet to come? Ah! [Sūn] Cè was the first lord, the Wú foundational state ruler, the officers and ministers in line, were all his old friends, but his successor son was young and weak, incapable of shouldering burden, to esteem him then would be Lǚ [Duke] Huán<sup>33</sup> and Tián Fú's troubles,<sup>34</sup> to honor him then Yǔyí and Zíféng's<sup>35</sup> disasters would rise. Therefore in rectifying names and settling foundations, to cause noble and base to be distinguished and separated, afterward the state would be without reproach of decline, later posterity would have no suspicion of envy, various feelings would be cut off from heretical discussion, not indulging in lustful heart. Although emotion was violated, although the situation was ungenerous, as for securing purse and distantly planning, forever protecting and preserving walls, it can be called dealing with the not yet occurred, governing the not yet chaotic. Sir Chén's appraisal, it does not understand this!<sup>36</sup>

〔一〕 孫盛曰：孫氏兄弟皆明略絕群。創基立事，策之由也，自臨終之日，顧命委權。夫意氣之間，猶有刎頸，況天倫之篤愛，豪達之英鑒，豈吝名號於既往，違本情之至實哉？抑將遠思虛盈之數，而慎其名器者乎？夫正本定名，為國之大防；杜絕疑貳，消釁之良謀。是故魯隱矜義，終致羽父之禍；宋宣懷仁，卒有殤公之哀。皆心存小善，而不達經綸之圖；求譽當年，而不思貽厥之謀。可謂輕千乘之國，蹈道則未也。孫氏因擾攘之際，得奮其縱橫之志，業非積德之基，邦無磐石之固，勢一則祿祚可終，情乖則禍亂塵起，安可不防微於未兆，慮難於將來？壯哉！策為首事之君，有吳開國之主；將相在列，皆其舊也，而嗣子弱劣，析薪弗荷，奉之則魯桓、田市之難作，崇之則與夷、子馮之禍興。是以正名定本，使貴賤殊邈，然後國無陵肆之責，後嗣罔猜忌之嫌，群情絕異端之論，不逞杜覬覦之心；於情雖違，於事雖儉，至於括囊遠圖，永保維城，可謂為之于其未有，治之于其未亂者也。陳氏之評，其未達乎！

---

find out and therefore instead told Duke Huán that Duke Yǐn intended to kill him and offered to kill Duke Yǐn first. Duke Huán agreed, and Yǔfù had Duke Yǐn assassinated. See the Lǚ Hereditary House in SJ 33.

<sup>31</sup> Duke Xuān of Sòng, because his son was still young, installed his younger brother Duke Mù as his successor at his death in 729 BC. Duke Mù installed his nephew Duke Xuān's son as his successor, who became Duke Shāng, but Duke Shāng was later killed and replaced by Duke Mù's son Duke Zhuāng. See the Sòng Hereditary House in SJ 38.

<sup>32</sup> This is a quote from *Kǒng-zǐ Jiāyǔ*, "thinking little of a thousand chariot state, but heavily of one speech's faith." In Zhōu ideals, Heaven's Son maintained an army of ten thousand chariots, large vassal states one thousand chariots.

<sup>33</sup> Duke Huán of Lǚ, brother of Duke Yǐn, was murdered while visiting Qí at the order of the elder brother of his wife, Duke Xiāng of Qí.

<sup>34</sup> Tián Fú (d. 206 BC) is attached to the biographies of his father Tián Dān in SJ 94 and HS 33. He was enthroned as a puppet King of Qí by Tián Róng, who later killed and replaced him as King of Qí.

<sup>35</sup> Yǔyí was the personal name of Sòng Duke Shāng, Duke Shāng being his posthumous name. Zíféng was Sòng Duke Zhuāng, who replaced Duke Shāng.

<sup>36</sup> To summarize Sūn Shèng's argument, keeping Sūn Shào at a lesser noble rank was a wise move to prevent potential conflict between Sūn Cè's line and Sūn Quán's line over the rulership of Wú. However, one may note that it did not save Cè's grandson Fèng from Quán's grandson Hào.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

### Standard Histories

SJ *Shǐ jì* 史記 by Sīmǎ Qiān 司馬遷 (146 BC – ~86 BC)

HS *Hàn shū* 漢書 by Bān Gù 班固 (32 – 92) et al

with commentary 注 by Yán Shīgǔ 顏師古 (581 – 645)

HHS *Hòu Hàn shū* 後漢書

Annals 紀 and Biographies 傳 by Fàn Yè 範曄 (396 – 446)

Treatises 志 incorporated from *Xù Hàn shū* 續漢書 of Sīmǎ Biāo 司馬彪

with commentary 注 by Lǐ Xián 李賢

SGZ *Sān guó zhì* 三國志 by Chén Shòu 陳壽 (233 – 297)

Commentary 注 by Péi Sōngzhī 裴松之 (372 – 451)

Vernacular Translation 白话三国志 (2008) by Wáng Jìngzhī 王靜芝 et al

JS *Jìn shū* 晉書 compiled by Fáng Xuánlíng 房玄齡 (578 – 648) et al

SongS *Sòng shū* 宋書 compiled by Shěn Yuē 沈約 (441 – 513)

### Other Early Works

SSXY *Shìshuō Xīnyǔ* 世說新語 compiled by Liú Yìqìng 劉義慶 (403 – 444)

with commentary 注 by Liú Xiàobiāo 劉孝標 (462 – 521)

ZZTJ *Zīzhì Tōngjiàn* 資治通鑑 compiled by Sīmǎ Guāng 司馬光 (1019 – 1098)

with commentary 注 by Hú Sānxǐng 胡三省 (1230 – 1302)

SGYY *Sānguó Yǎnyì* 三國演義 attributed to Luó Guànzōng 羅貫中 (14<sup>th</sup> c.)

### Modern Works

Bielenstein, Hans, *The Bureaucracy of Han Times*, Cambridge UP 1980

Brown, Miranda and de Crepsigny, Rafe, "Adoption in Han China," *Journal of the Economic and Social History of the Orient* 52 (April 2009), p. 229-266

Chittick, Andrew, "The Life and Legacy of Liu Biao: Governor, Warlord, and Imperial Pretender in Late Han China," in *Journal of Asian History* 37 (2003), p. 155-186

Cutter, Robert Joe, "Cao Zhi (192 – 232) and his Poetry," doctoral dissertation, University of Washington, Seattle 1983

---, "The Incident at the Gate: Cao Zhi, the succession, and literary fame," in *T'oung Pao* 71 (1985), p. 41-83

- , "The Death of Empress Zhen: fiction and historiography in early Medieval China," in *Journal of the American Oriental Society* 112 (1992), p. 577-583
- and Crowell, William Gordon, *Empresses and Consorts: selection from Chen Shou's Records of the Three States translated with annotations and introduction*, Hawaii UP 1999
- de Crespigny, Rafe, *Northern Frontier: the policies and strategy of the Later Han empire*, Canberra 1984
- , *Generals of the South: the foundation and early history of the Three Kingdoms state of Wu*, Canberra 1990
- , *Man from the Margin: Cao Cao and the Three Kingdoms: the Fifty-first George Ernest Morrison Lecture in Ethnology*, Canberra 1990
- , "The Three Kingdoms and Western Jin: a history of China in the third century AD" Part I in *East Asian History* 1 (Canberra, June 1991), 1-36; Part II in *East Asian History* 2 (Canberra, December 1991), p. 143-165
- , *To Establish Peace: being the chronicle of Later Han for the years 189 to 220 AD as recorded in chapters 59-69 of the Zizhi tongjian of Sima Guang; translated and annotated*, Canberra 1996
- , "A Question of Loyalty: Xun Yu, Cao Cao and Sima Guang," in *Sino-Asiatica: papers dedicated to Professor Liu Ts'un-yan on the occasion of his eighty-fifth birthday*, edited by Wang Gungwu, Rafe de Crespigny and Igore de Racheiltz, Canberra 2002, p. 30-59
- , *A Biographical Dictionary of Later Han to the Three Kingdoms (23-220 AD)*, Leiden 2007
- , *Imperial Warlord: a biography of Cao Cao 155-220 AD*, Leiden 2010
- , *Fire over Luoyang: A History of the Later Han Dynasty 23-220 AD*, Leiden 2016
- Dien, A. & Knapp, K. (Eds.). *The Cambridge History of China, Volume 2: The Six Dynasties, 220—589*, Cambridge UP 2019
- Espenak, Fred. "Six Millennium Catalog of Phases of the Moon." *AstroPixels*. 21 December 2014. <http://astropixels.com/ephemeris/phasescat/phasescat.html>
- Fang, Achilles, *The Chronicle of the Three Kingdoms (220-265): chapters 69-78 from the Tzu chih t'ung chien of Ssu-ma Kuang (1019-1086)*, Harvard UP: volume 1, 1952; volume 2, 1965
- Legge, James, *The Confucian Classics*, Hong Kong 1960:
- , *Volume I: The Confucian Analects, The Great Learning, The Doctrine of the Mean*
- , *Volume II: The Works of Mencius*
- , *Volume III: The Shoo King, or the Book of Historical Documents*
- , *Volume IV: The She King, or the Book of Poetry*
- , *Volume V: The Ch'un Ts'ew with the Tso Chuen*
- Lewis, Mark E., *The Early Chinese Empires: Qin and Han*, Harvard UP 2007
- , *China between Empires: the Northern and Southern Dynasties*, Harvard UP 2009

Mansvelt Beck, B. J., "The Fall of Han," in *The Cambridge History of China, volume 1, The Ch'in and Han empires 221 B.C.-A.D. 220*, 317-376

Nienhauser, William H. Jr, *The Grand Scribe's Records, by Ssu-ma Ch'ien*, Indiana UP:

----, *Volume I, the Basic Annals of Pre-Han China*, 1994

----, *Volume II, the Basic Annals of Han China*, 2002

----, *Volume V.1, the Hereditary Houses of Pre-Han China, Part I*, 2006

----, *Volume VII, the Memoirs of pre-Han China*, 1994

---, *Volume VIII, the Memoirs of Han China, Part I*, 2008

Xuē Zhòngsān 薛仲三 and Ōuyáng Yí 歐陽頤, Compilers, *A Sino-Western Calendar for Two Thousand Years: 1-2000 A.D. 兩千年中西西曆對照表*, Chángshā 1940.

Yáng, Zhèngyuán, *The Annals of Wèi*, 2020.