

THE STRATEGISTS PANG AND FA  
The Contributions of Pang Tong and Fa Zheng to the Foundations of Shu

Yang Zhengyuan

After the formal abdication of Han Dynasty in 220, the southwestern warlord Liu Bei, citing his distant relation to the Imperial Clan, claimed Imperial Title in 221, with himself as the next Emperor of a continued Han Dynasty. Despite this lofty claim, however, his state remained largely confined to the Sichuan basin, and both his rivals and most later historians rejected his claims of continuation of Han, and instead referred to his state as Shu, a local toponym for the region.<sup>1</sup>

This claim to Imperial Status in the Sichuan basin, however, was in fact the culmination of a decades long career as an itinerate warlord-adventurer mostly spent outside of the Sichuan basin. Liu Bei had begun his life and career in the far north of the Han Empire, and following the breakdown of Imperial authority in 189 he ended up fighting his way across the Central plains, the eastern coast, south to the middle Yangzi, visiting the southeast and lower Yangzi, before finally finding his refuge in the far southwest.<sup>2</sup> This last move into the Sichuan basin, from which he finally achieved enough stability to make his Imperial claims, was accomplished through the foundational work of two strategists: Pang Tong<sup>3</sup> and Fa Zheng.<sup>4</sup>

### *I. Liu Bei in Jing*

Amidst the chaos of the collapse of the Han Empire, Liu Bei rose to prominence through service to or alliance with the various regional warlords across the Central plains, joining and then abandoning or betraying them for better opportunities. In this way he moved from Gongsun Zan in the northern frontiers to Tao Qian on the eastern coast,<sup>5</sup> joined and then betrayed Cao Cao<sup>6</sup> in the central plains, joined and then abandoned Yuan Shao, and finally sought refuge with Liu Biao, based in Jing province, on the middle Yangzi river. By this time, he had apparently already developed something of a reputation for opportunism, for it is said that Liu Biao was reluctant to entrust Liu Bei with any major authority.<sup>7</sup>

By 208, Cao Cao had largely reunited most of the former Han Empire north of the Yangzi, and turned his attention southward. Liu Biao died and his son and successor Liu Cong surrendered as Cao Cao's army approached, and a desperate Liu Bei sought alliance with the young warlord Sun Quan,<sup>8</sup> based in the region of Wu in the lower Yangzi. At the celebrated battle of Red Cliffs, Sun Quan's General Zhou Yu repulsed Cao Cao's advance, and following Cao Cao's withdrawal north Zhou Yu launched a costly

---

1 See the discussion by J. Michael Farmer in "What's in a name? On the Appellative 'Shu' in Early Medieval Chinese Historiography."

2 The Biography of Liu Bei, posthumously Emperor Zhaolie, is in SGZ 32.

3 The Biography of Pang Tong is in SGZ 37, translated in Appendix A.

4 The Biography of Fa Zheng is in SGZ 37, translated in Appendix B.

5 The Biographies of Gongsun Zan and of Tao Qian are in SGZ 8.

6 The Annals of Cao Cao, posthumously Emperor Wu of Wei, is in SGZ 1.

7 The Biographies of Yuan Shao and of Liu Biao are in SGZ 6 and HHS 74. That Liu Bei was able to successfully continue changing his allegiances can be partially credited to the skill of his envoys such as Mi Zhu, Sun Qian, Jian Yong, and others, who have biographies in SGZ 38.

8 The Biography of Sun Quan, posthumously Emperor Da of Wu, is in SGZ 47.

but ultimately successful campaign that secured control of the middle Yangzi river and restricted the region of Cao Cao's control to the lower Han river.<sup>9</sup>

The situation between the allies Sun and Liu however remained tense, for Sun Quan had ambitions to expand up the Yangzi to unite the south, whereas Liu Bei had hopes for personal control over Jing province in the middle Yangzi. Zhou Yu proposed inviting and then detaining Liu Bei in Wu, but Sun Quan decided to further cement the alliance with a marriage between his younger sister the Lady Sun and Liu Bei. In 210 Zhou Yu died of illness, but Liu Bei remained concerned about the stability of his position in Jing province: to the north was his enemy Cao Cao, to the east a potentially dangerous rival Sun Quan, and in Jing province he was concerned that the fierce Lady Sun might cause trouble or rebellion directly at his home base.<sup>10</sup>

## *II. Liu Bei in Yi*

Upriver in the Sichuan basin, the territory of Yi province was controlled by Liu Zhang, another distant relation of the Imperial Clan.<sup>11</sup> He was not a man of great military ability or authority, had played only a very small role in the larger Imperial battleground at this time, and there were malcontents, namely Zhang Song and Fa Zheng, interested in replacing his regime with a more effective and decisive leader.<sup>12</sup> In 211, as Cao Cao was preparing to secure the west and northwest of the Empire, Liu Zhang became concerned about the stability of his northern borders, and Zhang Song was able to convince him to invite Liu Bei into Yi province, to serve as a junior ally and secure the province's north. Fa Zheng was sent as envoy downstream, but shortly after meeting with Liu Bei and relaying Liu Zhang's invitation, he revealed his true sympathies and urged Liu Bei to seize control of Yi province from Liu Zhang.

Before this, Liu Bei had been joined by Zhuge Liang<sup>13</sup> and by Pang Tong, who now served as his main advisors and subordinate administrators. Liu Bei left Zhuge Liang behind to manage his holdings in Jing province, while he brought Pang Tong with him to serve as his main advisor and strategist in Yi province.

Pang Tong appellative Shiyuan was a local from Jing province. He had briefly been a staff officer under Zhou Yu, but after the latter's death, he joined the service of Liu Bei. When Liu Bei entered Yi province, he was warmly greeted by Liu Zhang at Fu. At this stage, Pang Tong suggested capturing Liu Zhang by surprise in order to seize control of the province without battle, but Liu Bei rejected the plan as unfeasible, as he had yet to establish a popular following among the people in the province. After several months of feasting and exchanging gifts, Liu Zhang left Fu to return to his headquarters at Chengdu, while Liu Bei went north to Jiameng, nominally to prepare for a campaign into Hanzhong. In fact, Liu Bei remained there and focused on building his reputation and popular support.

---

9 The Biography of Zhou Yu is in SGZ 54.

10 According to annotations to the Biography of Fa Zheng in SGZ 37, the lady Sun greatly resembled her elder brothers, and kept a guard of maidservants armed with sabers around her at all times, so that whenever Liu Bei met with her he shivered in fear. Given the circumstances it seems likely that the marriage was never consummated. Liu Bei's anxiety over his position is also well summarized by a quote attributed to Zhuge Liang in SGZ 37.

11 The Biographies of Liu Zhang, and of his father Liu Yan, who was Governor of Yi province before him, are in SGZ 31.

12 The Biography of Fa Zheng in SGZ 37 provides an account of Zhang Song's and Fa Zheng's dissatisfaction in Liu Zhang and interest in replacing him with Liu Bei.

13 The Biography of Zhuge Liang, possibly the most important statesman of Shu, is in SGZ 36.

Some time during this phase, Pang Tong proposed three possible strategies for the conquest of Shu. The plan he considered best was to lead elite light troops in a forced march directly to Chengdu, catching and capturing Liu Zhang by surprise.

The plan after that was to claim some excuse to return east to Jing province and making a show of leaving. Liu Zhang's two Generals stationed south of Liu Bei, Gao Pei and Yang Huai, would assuredly send him off. Liu Bei could then take them by surprise, kill them and take over their troops, and use this larger force to move south against Chengdu.

The third and last plan, which Pang Tong considered worst, would be return east and link up with their base in Jing province, and with this support return to attack Yi province.

Of these, Liu Bei chose the second plan.<sup>14</sup> Near the end of 212, Liu Bei claimed he wished to return east to assist his ally Sun Quan against Cao Cao, and asked for more supplies and troops. Liu Zhang was probably upset with the situation, considering that Liu Bei had still not got around to launching a northern campaign, and was now asking to take more supplies and troops to leave east. Nevertheless, Liu Zhang agreed, but only sent half of what Liu Bei had requested.

Liu Bei now claimed that by holding back troops and supplies Liu Zhang had violated their alliance, and used this as his *cassus belli* in turning against his former host. He summoned Yang Huai and Gao Pei, took them by surprise to execute them and take command over their troops, and led this enlarged army south against Liu Zhang. By 213 he had reached Luo, having defeated and conquered everything in his way. However, during the siege of Luo, Pang Tong was hit by a stray arrow and died. It is said that Liu Bei would weep whenever he spoke of it.

In 214, as the campaign stalled, Liu Bei summoned additional reinforcements from Jing province, and separate divisions lead by Zhuge Liang, Zhang Fei, and Zhao Yun attacked Yi province from the east. Liu Bei reached and besieged Chengdu, and after several months Liu Zhang at last surrendered. Liu Bei took office as Governor of Yi province, and gave Liu Zhang an honorary title and sent him into exile in Jing province.

### *III. Securing the Future of Shu*

Fa Zheng appellative Xiaozhi had originally been from the Guanzhong region to the north of Yi, but during the chaos had fled south and joined Liu Zhang. However, he became frustrated at his future prospects and later conspired with Zhang Song to invite Liu Bei to replace Liu Zhang. After Liu Bei entered Shu, Fa Zheng remained with Liu Bei and served as an advisor. In 214, as Liu Bei took office as Governor of Yi province, Fa Zheng served as one of Liu Bei's most important subordinates in both administration and strategic planning.

In 217, with Liu Bei well established in Yi province, Fa Zheng urged Liu Bei to launch a northern campaign into Hanzhong.

The prefecture of Hanzhong, along the middle courses of the Han river and just south of the imposing Qinlang mountain range, was the northernmost portion of Yi province. However, during the tenure of Liu Yan as Governor of Yi province, he had let control of the region be seized by Zhang Lu, as an excuse to cut off contact with the Imperial Court.<sup>15</sup> However, after Liu Yan died and was succeeded by

<sup>14</sup> The proposals are detailed in the Biography of Pang Tong in SGZ 37.

<sup>15</sup> The Biography of Zhang Lu is in SGZ 8.

his son Liu Zhang, the relationship with Zhang Lu became hostile, and so Liu Zhang's northern borders became vulnerable. In 215, Cao Cao campaigned against Zhang Lu and received his surrender, but declined to follow up by attacking Liu Bei in Yi province.<sup>16</sup> Instead, Cao Cao returned north, leaving his officers Xiahou Yuan<sup>17</sup> and Zhang He to defend Hanzhong and probe Liu Bei's northern defenses.<sup>18</sup>

Fa Zheng correctly assessed that Cao Cao had left Hanzhong due to concerns elsewhere, and also argued that Xiahou Yuan and Zhang He could not hold Hanzhong against them, and urged a northern campaign to secure the region.<sup>19</sup> Indeed, capture of Hanzhong would give Liu Bei the imposing Qinlang mountain range as a shield against the north, while the lack of Hanzhong would leave Yi province vulnerable and exposed from the north, and be a constant source of anxiety as it had been to Liu Zhang before them.

The initial incursions into Hanzhong by Liu Bei's officers were defeated and driven back through 217 and 218. However, by 219 Liu Bei was fully committed to the campaign and gone personally into Hanzhong, with Fa Zheng as his chief advisor and strategist. As Liu Bei advanced to Dingjun mountain, Xiahou Yuan advanced to contest the area, and Fa Zheng recognized that Xiahou Yuan had overextended himself, urging Liu Bei to attack. Liu Bei's officer Huang Zhong<sup>20</sup> led a fierce attack, defeating Xiahou Yuan's army and killing Xiahou Yuan.

The remnants of Xiahou Yuan's forces, now commanded by Zhang He, was forced to withdraw further north, and Liu Bei advanced to consolidate his hold over the Han river. Cao Cao personally arrived, but after months of inconclusive fighting, he found that he could not reverse the situation, and evacuated the territory, relocating as many civilians as he could in order to devalue the conceded territory. Nevertheless, and though the depopulation would prove to have long term effects in restricting Shu's ability to expand further north, the conquest of Hanzhong was Liu Bei's finest victory,<sup>21</sup> and soon after he capped it off by claiming title as King of Hanzhong. Fa Zheng was appointed as the Director of Liu Bei's Secretariat, serving as one of Liu Bei's chief civil officers. The next year, however, he died.

Later in 222, after Liu Bei's disastrous campaign eastward against Sun Quan and Wu, Zhuge Liang sighed and remarked that had Fa Zheng lived, he could have convinced Liu Bei not to go through with the campaign, and even if the campaign had still happened, he could have prevented it from being so great a disaster.<sup>22</sup>

Both Pang Tong and Fa Zheng died before Liu Bei's claim of Imperial Title as the continuator of Han, but both had contributed immensely to Liu Bei's ability to make such a claim. Pang Tong was critical in Liu Bei's success in securing Yi province, and Fa Zheng was pivotal in Liu Bei's longer term success in

---

16 Commentators have criticized Cao Cao's decision to hold back at this stage, but a well argued defense of Cao Cao's decision to avoid over-committing is given by de Crespigny in *Imperial Warlord*. Indeed, Sun Quan's massive offensive against Hefei in the east while Cao Cao was away at Hanzhong in the west gives an example of exactly what could have gone wrong if Cao Cao had committed fully to conquering the west.

17 A cousin and brother-in-law of Cao Cao, his biography is in SGZ 9.

18 Zhang He led several incursions into Ba in northern Yi province, but was eventually defeated by Liu Bei's officer Zhang Fei, as detailed in their biographies in SGZ 17 and 36, respectively.

19 This proposal is detailed in Fa Zheng's biography in SGZ 37.

20 The Biography of Huang Zhong is in SGZ 36.

21 In *Imperial Warlord* and *Fire Over Luoyang*, de Crespigny argues that Liu Bei's victory over Xiahou Yuan was the actual decisive battle that led to the long term division of the Empire into three, not the more celebrated and famous battle of Red Cliffs. Had Cao Cao kept control of Hanzhong, it is unlikely that Liu Bei's state in Shu could have survived in the long term, and conquest of Shu by the north would in turn outflank Wu's defenses on the Yangzi river, as demonstrated in the Jin Dynasty's conquest of Wu in 280.

22 The anecdote of Zhuge Liang's remark is in Fa Zheng's biography in SGZ 37.

establishing himself in the province and securing the state's long term survival with the conquest of Hanzhong. As appraised by the historian Chen Shou, Pang Tong was like Wei's Xun Yu and Xun You, and Fa Zheng like Wei's Cheng Yu and Guo Jia.<sup>23</sup>

---

23 The biographies of Xun Yu and Xun You are in SGZ 10, of Cheng Yu and Guo Jia in SGZ 14.

APPENDIX A  
Translation of the Biography of Pang Tong, SGZ 37

Páng Tǒng appellative Shìyuán was a Xiāngyáng man. When young he was simple and dull, and no one yet took note of him. Yǐngchuān's Sīmǎ Huī was pure and elegant and had understanding of people like a mirror. When [Páng] Tǒng was capped he went to meet [Sīmǎ] Huī, [Sīmǎ] Huī was picking mulberries from atop a tree, seated [Páng] Tǒng below the tree, and they talked together from day until night. [Sīmǎ] Huī was deeply impressed with him, and praised him as the greatest among the scholars of the southern provinces, and from this he gradually gained fame. (1) Later the prefecture appointed him as Merit Officer.

By nature he was good with people relations, diligent in fostering and mentoring. Every time he praised someone, it often surpassed their actual ability, a person at the time was confused and asked him about it, and [Páng] Tǒng answered: “Now Under Heaven is in great chaos, customs and principles confused, good people few but evil people many. Suppose we wish to revive good customs, and prolong principled activity; if we do not praise them their reputation will not be enough to be admired, and if they are not enough to be admired then those who follow their good example will be few. Now I recommend ten but am wrong about five, yet still I have gotten half, and those can be lofty examples to teach the present, cause the ambitious to motivate themselves, is this not acceptable?”

Wú General Zhōu Yú assisted Xiānzhǔ [Liú Bèi] in capturing Jīngzhōu, and was therefore appointed Administrator of Nán prefecture. [Zhōu] Yú died, and [Páng] Tǒng escorted the body to Wú, and so of the Wú people many heard of his name. When he was about to return west, they all gathered at Chāng Gate. Lù Jì, Gù Shào, and Quán Cóng all went. Tǒng said: “Master Lù [Jì] can be said to be an old horse that still has outstanding energy, Master Gù [Shào] can be said to be an old ox that can still carry heavy burdens very far.” (2)

He said to Quán Cóng: “You sir are generous and admire reputation, resembling Rǔnán's Fán Zǐzhāo. (3) Though your intelligence is not excessive, yet you are still exceptional in this time.”

[Lù] Jì and [Gù] Shào said to [Páng] Tǒng: “When Under Heaven is pacified, then you and us should together the scholars of the [world within] the Four Seas.” They with [Páng] Tǒng became very close and returned.

(1) *Xiāngyángjì* “Records of Xiāngyáng” states:

Zhūgě [Liàng] Kǒngmíng as the Hidden Dragon, Páng [Tǒng] Shìyuán as the Phoenix Fledgling, Sīmǎ [Huī] Décāo as the Water Mirror, were all Páng Dégōng's sayings.

[Páng] Dégōng was a man of Xiāngyáng. [Zhūgě] Kǒngmíng every time arriving at his house, alone bowed below the couch, and [Páng] Dégōng always did not stop him. [Sīmǎ] Décāo once visited [Páng] Dégōng, just as he was crossing the Miǎn, going up to offer sacrifices to his ancestors' tomb. [Sīmǎ] Décāo directly entered his household, called on [Páng] Dégōng's wife and children, to have them quickly prepare millet: “Xú [Shù] Yuánzhí said to me that a guest will come to meet me and Lord Páng to talk.” The wives and children all lined up to pay respects below the hall, and hurried to make preparations. Very quickly, [Páng] Dégōng returned, and stood in attention for the meeting, but did not know who was the guest. [Sīmǎ]

Décāo was younger than [Páng] Dégōng by ten years, so treated him as an elder brother in matters, called him Lord Páng, and therefore people of the time said that Lord Páng [Páng Gōng] was [Páng] Dégōng's personal name, but this was not true.

[Páng] Dégōng's son [Páng] Shānmín] also had good reputation, wed Zhūgě Kǒngmíng's youngest elder sister, became a Wèi Yellow Gate Appointment Gentleman, and died young. His son [Páng] Huàn styled Shìwén, during Jìn's Tàikāng [280-289] became Administrator of Zāngkē. [Páng] Tǒng was [Páng] Dégōng's nephew, when young did not have anyone take note of him, and only [Páng] Dégōng valued him. At eighteen years, he was sent to meet [Sīmǎ] Décāo. [Sīmǎ] Décāo talked with him, and afterward sighed and said: "[Páng] Dégōng truly knows people. This is truly [a boy of] majestic moral character."

(2) Zhāng Bó's *Wúlù* "Records of Wù" states:

Someone asked Tǒng: "So in your eyes, Master Lù is the superior?"

Tǒng said: "Though a worn horse is agile, it carries one person and that is all. Though a worn ox in one day can only go three hundred lǐ, how can what it carries be only one person?"

[Gù] Shào visited Tǒng's lodgings, conversed, and therefore asked: "You have reputation for knowing men. Of you and me who is superior?"

Tǒng said: "In teaching proper social customs, appraising and selecting people, I do not reach you. In discussing the secret plans of rulers, seizing on the most critical opportunities, I seem to have a day's advantage."

[Gù] Shào agreed with these words and became closer with him.

(3) Jiǎng Jì's *Wànjīlùn* "Discussion of Myriad Opportunities" says that Xǔ [Shào] Zǐjiāng's appraisals was was not fair, because he promoted Fán Zǐzhāo but hindered Xǔ [Jìng] Wénxiū. Liú Yè said: "Zǐzhāo was promoted from among merchants, in age already with obedient ear [sixty], when withdrawing could preserve tranquility, when advancing could be without carelessness." [Jiǎng] Jì answered: "Zǐzhāo truly from youth to age maintain cleanliness, but observing his elegance and speech, he was surely no match for [Xǔ] Wénxiū."

Xiānzhǔ governed Jīngzhōu, and [Páng] Tǒng from Advisor became Lěiyáng Magistrate, at the county could not govern well, and was dismissed from office. Wú General Lǚ Sù sent Xiānzhǔ a letter that said: "Páng [Tǒng] Shìyuán is not a talent for [managing a small] hundred lǐ [territory]. Employ him with appointment as Internal Manager or Aide-de-Camp, only then can he develop his incredible talent and that is all." Zhūgě Liàng also said this to Xiānzhǔ, Xiānzhǔ met with him and admired his reputation, greatly entrusted him and appointed him Internal Manager Advisor. (1) His close treatment was second only to Zhūgě Liàng, and therefore with [Zhūgě] Liàng both served as Military Master Internal Gentleman-General. (2) [Zhūgě] Liàng defended Jīngzhōu. [Páng] Tǒng accompanied in entering Shǔ.

(1) *Jiāngbiǎozhuàn* "Biographies Beyond the Jiāng" states:

Xiānzhǔ with [Páng] Tǒng were leisurely at a feast chatting, and asked: "You were Zhōu [Yú] Gōngjǐn's Merit Officer. When I went to Wú, I heard this man secretly had a matter where he

urged [Sūn Quán] Zhòngmóu to detain me. Was it so? When with a master he is your master. You must not hide anything.”

Tǒng answered: “It was.”

[Liú] Bèi sighed and said: “I at that time was in danger, but they had rescued me, therefore I could not but go, and almost did not escape Zhōu Yú’s grasp! Under Heaven’s scholars of wisdom and strategy can be seen to have similar plans. At the time [Zhūgě] Kǒngmíng remonstrated me to not go, and his intentions were very severe. He had also thought of this. I believe because I was [Sūn] Zhòngmóu’s defense against the north, and so he relied on me as his assistance, and therefore I decided to have no doubts. This truly was entering into dangerous paths, and not a plan of absolute security.”

(2) *Jiǔzhōu Chūnqū* “Chronicles of the Nine Provinces” states:

Tǒng advised [Liú] Bèi: “Jīngzhōu is desolate and ruined, the people exhausted completely, to the east is Sūn [Quán] of Wú, to the north is Cáo [Cāo], so the plan to maintain tripartite balance will be difficult to achieve. Now Yìzhōu’s state is rich and people strong, its population in the millions, four regions with troops and horses, when setting out one can certainly gather, and treasures do not need to be asked for from the outside. Now you can seize it to settle your great enterprise.”

[Liú] Bèi said: “Now, the one with which I am like water and fire, is Cáo Cāo. [Cáo] Cāo is suspicious, I am lenient. [Cáo] Cāo is cruel, I am benevolent. [Cáo] Cāo is deceitful, I am loyal. If I am always opposing [Cáo] Cāo, the matter then can be achieved and that is all. Now for a small reason I would lose the faith and righteousness to Under Heaven. I will not take it.”

[Páng] Tǒng said: “This is the time to do what is expedient, and not what can be settled by a single principle. Conquering the small and attacking secretly was the business of the Five Hegemons. Capturing the rebellious and defending the obedient, repaying them with righteousness, after the matter is settled giving fief with large states, how is that turning back on faith? Today if you do not take it, in the end it will be someone else’s benefit.

[Liú] Bèi therefore went.

Governor of Yìzhōu Liú Zhāng with Xiānzhǔ gathered at Fú. Tǒng suggested a plan: “Now at this meeting, you can seize him, and then you General without using troops can occupy and settle the whole province.” Xiānzhǔ said: “I have newly entered another state, and my grace and faith is not yet made known, so this cannot be.”

When [Liú] Zhāng returned to Chéngdū, Xiānzhǔ was about to for [Liú] Zhāng campaign north into Hànzōng. [Páng] Tǒng again advised:

“Secretly select elite troops, travel day and night, and directly attack Chéngdū. [Liú] Zhāng is both unskilled in military affairs, and also never prepared. When the main army arrives, with one move things will be settled. This is the best plan.

“Yáng Huái and Gāo Pèi are [Liú] Zhāng’s famous Generals, each lead strong troops, defending and occupying Guāntóu, and one hears that they have several times sent letters remonstrating [Liú] Zhāng,

urging him to send you General back to Jīngzhōu. Now General before you arrive, send someone to them to report, saying Jīngzhōu has an emergency, and that you wish to rescue it, while simultaneously preparing attire to outwardly look like you will return. These two both respect your great reputation General, and also will be happy that you will leave, and certainly plan to ride with light cavalry to come meet. You General can then seize them, advance and take over their troops, and then head toward Chéngdū. This is the middle plan.

“Retreating back to Báidì, joining up with Jīngzhōu, and slowly return to make plans. This is the worst plan.

“If you delay and do not go, then you will be in great trouble, and cannot last.”

Xiānzhǔ therefore followed the middle plan, beheaded [Yáng] Huái and [Gāo] Pèi, returned to head toward Chéngdū, and all that he passed he conquered. At Fǔ he held a great gathering, setting up wine and making merry, and said to [Páng] Tǒng: “Today’s gathering can be said to be merry.”

[Páng] Tǒng said: “Attacking another man’s state and believing it joyous, is not the warfare of the benevolent.”

Xiānzhǔ was drunk, and angrily said: “[Zhōu] Wǔ-wáng attacked [Shāng] Zhòu[-wáng], and first sang and afterward danced. Was he not benevolent? Your words are improper, and you should get out!”

Therefore [Páng] Tǒng immediately left.

Xiānzhǔ was regretful, and asked him to return. [Páng] Tǒng returned to his previous seat, but at first did not look back or apologize, and ate and drank as usual. Xiānzhǔ said: “In that conversation, who was wrong?”

[Páng] Tǒng answered: “You and I were both wrong.”

Xiānzhǔ greatly laughed, and feasted merrily as before. (1)

- (1) Xí Zuòchǐ states: One who would be overlord, must take benevolence and righteousness as his base, wield faith and obedience as his model; if one thing is not included, then the way is violated. Now Liú Bèi attacked and seized [Liú] Zhāng’s territory, using power to serve his enterprise, turning back on faith and violating human feeling, virtue and righteousness both transgressed, and though by this achievement he prospered, he should have greatly grieved for his defeated enemies, like breaking a hand to preserve the body, what merry can there be? Páng Tǒng feared this speech would be leaked, knew his lord would certainly become aware, therefore in the midst of the everyone rectified his fault, and did not hold to his usual modest way, correcting to the utmost, and thoroughly showing his manner of loyally given honest speech. A superior at fault but who can correct it will have followers, one who can accept success but not hold to it follows reason. One with followers will then ascend the steps to the high palace hall. One following reason will then have all their plans be completed. With one speech three goods were all illuminated, with one remonstrance righteousness was manifested for a hundred generations, this can be said to reach to be a greatest example. If one begrudges their small faults and throw away their great advantage, sympathizes with mistaken speech, will itself cut off from honesty, those able to achieve their enterprise and complete their affairs, there has never been such before.

Your Servant Sōngzhī believes the plot to attack Liú Zhāng, though the plan came from Tǒng, yet it violated righteousness to achieve merit, and so at its root followed a deceptive path, his heart already was guilty inside, and happy feelings he restrained himself. Therefore when he heard [Liú] Bèi' speak with happy words, he was unconsciously frank and answered thus. [Liú] Bèi at the feast drank for too much time, was merry at another's misfortune, compared himself to [Zhōu] Wǔ-wáng, all without a look of shame. This was [Liú] Bèi being wrong and Tǒng without fault. This statement "You and I were both wrong" was speech to avoid insulting and that is all. Mister Xí [Zuòchǐ] in this discussion, though the main purpose is without fault, yet the implications of his words, have digressed and dissipated.

They advanced to encircle Luò county, [Páng] Tǒng commanded the armies in attacking the city, and was by a flying arrow struck, and died, at the time aged thirty-six years. Xiānzhǔ grieved, and whenever speaking of it would weep. He appointed [Páng] Tǒng's father as Consultant-Gentleman, promoted to Remonstrance-Grandee, and Zhūgě Liàng personally paid respects. He posthumously bestowed on [Páng] Tǒng fief as Marklord Within the Passes. Posthumous name *Jìng-hóu* "Tranquil Marklord."

[Páng] Tǒng's son [Páng] Hóng, appellative Jùshī, was outspoken and simple and dared criticize wrongdoing, was arrogant to Director of the Secretariat Chén Dī, was by [Chén] Dī held back, and died as Administrator of Fúlíng.

[Páng] Tǒng's younger brother [Páng] Lín, as Jīngzhōu Internal Manager Advisor accompanied General Defending the North Huáng Quán on campaign against Wú. It happened that the army was defeated, and he followed [Huáng] Quán into Wèi. Wèi gave him fief as a full Marklord, and he reached Administrator of Jùlù. (1)

- (1) *Xiāngyángjì* states: [Páng] Lín's wife was Xí Zhēn of the same commandery's younger sister. The matter of [Xí] Zhēn is in Yáng Xì's Fǔchéngzàn "Appraisals of Supporting Ministers." When Excellency Cáo defeated Jīngzhōu [208], [Páng] Lín's wife was from [Páng] Lín separated, and alone raised their weak daughter for over ten years. Later [Páng] Lín followed Huáng Quán to surrender to Wèi, and only then were they again reunited. Wèi *Wén-dì* [Cáo Pī] heard of and praised this, bestowing bed curtains and clothes, in order to make know their righteous moral conduct.

APPENDIX B  
Translation of the Biography of Fa Zheng, SGZ 37

Fǎ Zhèng appellative Xiàozhí was Fúfēng Méi man. His grandfather [Fǎ] Zhēn had pure integrity and high reputation. (1) At Jiàn'ān's beginning [196] Under Heaven was in famine and desolation, [Fǎ] Zhèng with his same prefecture's Mèng Dá together entered Shǔ to join Liú Zhāng, for a long time was Magistrate of Xīndū, and afterward was summoned to serve as Military Commentator Colonel. Since he was not well appointed, and also was by other refugees and guests from the same province and village slandered as without moral conduct, his ambitions were suppressed.

Yìzhōu Aide-de-Camp Zhāng Sōng with [Fǎ] Zhèng were friendly with each other, speculated that [Liú] Zhāng was too lacking to be successful, and often secretly sighed. [Zhāng] Sōng at Jīngzhōu met Excellency Cáo and returned, and urged [Liú] Zhāng to cut off with Excellency Cáo and instead ally with Xiānzhǔ [Liú Bèi]. [Liú] Zhāng said: "Who can be sent as envoy?" [Zhāng] Sōng then recommended [Fǎ] Zhèng, [Fǎ] Zhèng declined, but could not but go. When [Fǎ] Zhèng returned, he said to [Zhāng] Sōng that Xiānzhǔ had heroism and planning, they conspired to join him, hoping to together invite him, but did not yet have an opportunity. Later because [Liú] Zhāng heard Excellency Cáo wished to send Generals to campaign against Zhāng Lǚ had a terrified heart, and [Zhāng] Sōng therefore persuaded [Liú] Zhāng that they should welcome Xiānzhǔ, to employ him to suppress [Zhāng] Lǚ, and again order [Fǎ] Zhèng to send the message.

After [Fǎ] Zhèng announced the message, he secretly suggested to Xiānzhǔ: "With your outstanding talent wise General, taking advantage of Governor Liú [Zhāng]'s weakness, and Zhāng Sōng, the province's trusted aide, to respond from the inside, therefore capitalizing on Yìzhōu's prosperity, and the abundant land's rugged geography, with this you can achieve your enterprise, as easily as turning a hand."

Xiānzhǔ agreed with this, going up the Jiāng west, and with [Liú] Zhāng met at Fú. They went north to Jiāméng, then returned south to capture [Liú] Zhāng.

(1) *Sānfǔ Juélùzhù* "Three Adjutants Records Annotations" states:

[Fǎ] Zhēn styled Gāoqīng, when young understood the Five Classics, and also knew divination, studied without a permanent teacher, and had reputation for high ability. Once he wore plain headscarf to meet the Administrator of Fúfēng. The Administrator said: "Though [Lǚ] Āi-gōng was not worthy yet he had for a subject Zhòngní [Confucius]. Lǚ Xiàhuì did not leave the country of his parents. I wish to borrow you as a Merit Officer, how about it?"

[Fǎ] Zhēn said: "Because from you wise governor I have met with treatment with courtesy, therefore I have always come to pay respects. But if you wish to make me an official to send me as envoy, I will then be north of the northernmost mountains and south of the southernmost mountains."

The Administrator of Fúfēng therefore did not dare take him as an official.

Previously, [Fǎ] Zhēn had not yet been capped, his father was at Nán-jùn, he walked to visit his father. He wished to go, but his father kept him there to stay for the New Year, and had him

watch how the officials gathered together. The gathered were several hundred people, and [Fǎ] Zhēn through a window watched them talk with his father. When it was finished, he asked [Fǎ] Zhēn: “Who there was worthy?”

[Fǎ] Zhēn said: “Official Hú Guǎng has ability to be among the Excellency and Ministers.”

Later [Hú] Guǎng indeed held rank in the Nine Ministers and Three Excellencies, and the generation admired [Fǎ] Zhēn’s understanding of people. From beginning to end he was recruited, but always he did not accept, and his friends Guō Zhèng and others praised him, calling him Mister Xuándé “Mysterious Virtue.” Aged eighty-nine years, Zhōngpíng fifth year [188], he died.

Zhèng’s father Yǎn styled Jímóu, was an official to the Excellency over the Masses, and Left Supervisor to the Minister of Justice.

Zhèng Dù said to [Liú] Zhāng (1): “General of the Left leads county armies to attack us, his troops are not even ten thousand, and the people are not attached to him, the grain in the fields is their supplies, and they have no heavy supply wagons. Of the plans for this none are better than to completely evacuate Bāxī and Zītóng’s people within the Fú river’s west, burn all of their granaries and fields, use high walls and deep moats, and hold position to resist them. When they arrive and seek battle, do not respond, and eventually they will lose their supplies, and without passing a hundred days they will inevitably flee. When they flee and we strike them, then they can certainly be taken.”

Xiānzhǔ heard and feared this, and asked [Fǎ] Zhèng. [Fǎ] Zhèng said: “To the end it will not be used, there is nothing to worry about.” [Liú] Zhāng indeed was as [Fǎ] Zhèng said, saying to his subordinates: “I have heard of fighting the enemy in order to calm the people, but never of disrupting the people to avoid the enemy.” Therefore he dismissed [Zhèng] Dù and did not use his plan.

When the army besieged Luòchéng, [Fǎ] Zhèng wrote to [Liú] Zhāng:

“I by nature lack skill, completed the alliance arrangements but came to disobey you, and fear your attendants will not understand the true reasons, and will certainly place all the blame on me, but I can be disgraced to my end, and in disgrace carry on my duties, and therefore debase myself out here, and do not dare turn from my path. I feared your holiness will hear filth and evil in these sounds, and therefore in the meantime did not send letter or alarm, but thinking back to how I was treated, looking ahead I think this is not to late. Therefore from beginning to end I reveal my innermost thoughts, from the earliest all the way to the latest, I truly did not hide any emotions, and though sometimes I did not do my utmost, yet I never had any secret plans, only my good faith was not recognized, and so it came to this and that is all.

“Now that state’s affairs are already critical, disaster coming quickly, and though I am serving outside, and my words easy to be greatly hated, yet I have something I wish to share, to use my remaining loyalty. Wise General, your true heart, I know well, and truly it is not wanting to lose the General of the Left’s good relations, but that it ended like this, is because your attendants do not understand the way to follow and serve heroes, saying that one can violate faith and blacken vows, and instead respond to the situation, as the sun and moon shift, hurriedly seeking to please your ears and eyes, and therefore flatter and fawn, and so do not plan long term with thorough calculations for the state. The incident has already happened, and also they do not judge strength and weakness, believing the General of the Left’s army is far from home with no provisions or grain stored, and wish to mostly hold back many and

rarely strike, and pass the days locked together. But in fact coming from the pass to here, all in the way has been defeated, all the separate strongholds and division garrisons have themselves withered and fallen. Though below Luò there are ten thousand troops, they are all beaten soldiers, Generals of defeated armies, and if you wish to fight a decisive battle, then your troops and generals in their strength are truly no match. All your planners plan to outlast our provisions, but now these strongholds are already taken, and grain and rice is already gathered, while your territory Wise General is daily lost, the common people daily suffer, so your enemies then increase, and your supporters grow distant and few. I humbly have considered all this, and say you will certainly be finished first, and so should not again believe in outlasting us. You can in vain defend against us, but cannot last against us.

“Now Zhāng [Fēi] Yìdé’s army of tens of thousands, has already settled Bādōng, entered Qiánwèi’s borders, with divisions pacifying Zīzhōng and Déyáng as they invade by three distant roads, and how can you resist this? Currently your planners, Wise General, are certainly saying that this army is far from home without provisions, their food supply lines falling short, their troops few without followers. Now Jīngzhōu’s roads are connected, incoming armies increase tenfold, and moreover [General of] Chariots and Cavalry Sūn [Quán] sends his younger brother with Lǐ Yì, Gān Níng, and others to follow after. If you wish to compare with this master’s power, then in considering the one with greater territory, now this side has Bādōng, Guǎnghàn, Qiánwèi, so over half has already been settled, while the one commandery of Bāxī is also not what you Wise General can hold. So it can be judged that Yìzhōu relies only on Shǔ [commandery], but Shǔ is already defeated and ruined; two thirds are lost, officials and people are destitute, and those thinking of rebelling against you are eight out of ten households; if the enemy is distant then the common people cannot endure your conscription, if the enemy is near then in one morning we will have changed who is the master. Guǎnghàn’s various counties are a clear example. Also Yúfù and Guāntóu are truly the gateways deciding Yìzhōu’s success or ruin, and now the two gates are both open, your strongest cities are all fallen, your various armies all broken, your soldiers and Generals all used up, while your enemy by several roads advance, already enter into the province’s heart and guts, while you sit and defend [Chéng]dū and Luò, and whether you succeed or perish can already clearly be seen.

“This is only the big picture, of what is happening outside and that is all, the rest is confused and difficult to speak of completely. If someone as lowly as me can yet know this situation cannot be turned into success, all the more for the wise strategic thinkers in your attendants Wise General, how can they not see this situation? From dawn to discuss they cheat your favor, seeking good appearances to flatter, not thinking of the long term plan, none able to devote all their hearts to present a good strategy and that is all. If the situation comes to the utmost urgency, then each will save their own lives, seek to rescue their own families, change their allegiances back and forth, and will be different from their present plans, and not go with you Wise General to death and disaster, but your honored household would yet receive what they fear. Though I have already been slandered as disloyal, yet my heart says to myself that I do not turn back against your holiness’s virtue. Only when looking back to my separate mission, I am truly grieved. The General of the Left from when he first came, his old heart has regretted leaving, and truly he has no unkind intentions. I humbly believe you can change your plans, in order to save your honored household.”

(1) Huà Yáng’s Guózhi states: [Zhèng] Dù was a man of Guǎnghàn, and became a Provincial Advisor.

Nineteenth year [214], they advanced to besiege Chéngdū, [Liú] Zhāng’s Administrator of Shǔ-jùn Xǔ Jīng was about leave the city to surrender, the matter was discovered, and unsuccessful. [Liú] Zhāng

because danger was so near therefore did not execute [Xǔ] Jìng. When [Liú] Zhāng bowed in submission, Xiānzhǔ because of this thought little of [Xǔ] Jìng and did not employ him.

[Fǎ] Zhèng said: “The world Under Heaven has those with empty reputation but no real ability, and Xǔ Jìng is one. But now your honor has newly begun a great enterprise, and cannot explain things to the realm’s people household by household, while [Xǔ] Jìng’s hollow reputation has spread across the Four Seas, and if you are disrespectful, the realm’s people will because of it say that your honor does not value the worthy. It is proper to be deeply respectful, to impress the distant and near, just as in the past the King of Yān treated Guō Wěi.”

Xiānzhǔ therefore generously treated [Xǔ] Jìng. (1)

[Fǎ] Zhèng was appointed Administrator of Shǔ prefecture and General Raising Martial Ability, outside governing the capital territory and inside serving as chief strategist. From the kindness of one meal to the evil of a glance, none did he not pay back, and without authority he killed those who harmed him, several people. Someone said to Zhūgě Liàng: “Fǎ Zhèng in Shǔ prefecture has too much control. General you should inform our lord [Liú Bèi] to restrain his power and fortune.”

[Zhūgě] Liàng answered: “When our lord was at Gōng’ān, to the north he feared Excellency Cáo’s power, to the east he feared Sūn Quán’s pressure. and nearby he feared Lady Sūn would cause rebellion right under his armpit. At that time, both advancing and retreating was blocked by wolves, but Fǎ Xiàozhí served as his assisting wings, allowing him to suddenly soar up high, so that he would never again be restrained. How can we forbid Fǎ Zhèng from doing as he wishes!”

Previously, Sūn Quán wed his younger sister to Xiānzhǔ. She was capable and fast with strong fierceness, resembled her elder brothers, was attended by over a hundred maidservants, all personally wielding sabers while standing in attendance. Every time Xiānzhǔ entered, his whole heart was always shivering in fear. [Zhūgě] Liàng also knew that Xiānzhǔ greatly loved and trusted [Fǎ] Zhèng, and therefore spoke like this. (2)

- (1) Sūn Shèng states: Respecting worthies and esteeming virtue is the important path of statecraft, honoring tombs and visiting gates were they standards of past rulers. Therefore one must take as example the outstanding and profound, of high righteousness dominating the age, and then afterward one can long overlook the Four Seas, and shake and rule over the multitudes. If it is not such a man, the way cannot be falsely followed. [Xǔ] Jìng in the household to his kinsman was not reverent, going out was appointed where he did not belong, in speaking of his faith he was quick to change his heart in facing danger, in discussing his intelligence he entered danger in his first action. How could he be given foremost favor in order to move others? If then the false and superficial are esteemed, unfairly taking this glory, then for truly upright and righteous men, with what courtesy are they to be treated with? Zhèng used a method to confuse matters, was of the air to violate the noble and esteemed, gave the example of Guō Wěi, wronging natural human relations.

Your Servant Sōngzhī believes Guō Wěi was not worthy but for his ability in planning received favor, and moreover [Xǔ Jìng] Wénxiū’s reputation was already established, and Under Heaven said he was outstanding and great, and though in his final years had blemishes, yet the matter was not obvious and clear. If he did not receive courtesy, how would it be explained to the confused far and near? Fǎ Zhèng in comparing [Xǔ] Jìng to [Guō] Wěi, was not inappropriate, but [Sūn] Shèng in making things difficult by citing honoring tombs and visiting gates, how

pedantic! If that were the case, then even Yān Zhāo[-wáng] would also be wrong, how would it only be Old Liú [Bèi]? As for not reverent to his kinsman, the fault was with [Xǔ Shào] Zǐjiāng. From looking at the discussion of Jiǎng Jì, one can know it was not [Xǔ Jìng] Wénxiū's fault. [Sūn] Shèng also ridiculed him as appointed where he did not belong, this was speaking of his service due to Dǒng Zhuó. When [Dǒng] Zhuó first gained controlled the government, he recruited all the worthy and talented, and those that received office and rank were all awe-inspiring like this. [Xǔ Jìng] Wénxiū was selected as an official before [Dǒng] Zhuó had arrived. Later he was promoted to Palace Deputy, and did not exceed this. If this is to be disparaged, then the sort as Xún Shuǎng and Chén Jǐ should all be rejected in their times.

- (2) Sūn Shèng states: Power and fortune to the inferior is the path to destroying families and harming the state. Punishments being undone due to favor is the origin of ruined government and confused judgment. How can someone for being an accomplished minister have utmost lack of restraint, for being a favorite infringe upon state power? Therefore though Diān Xié was diligent he did not escape the punishment for disobedience, though Yáng Gān was a relative, yet was killed for rebellious conduct. How was that because of lack of love? It was because it was the ruler's law. Mister Zhūgě's speech therefore fails in governance and authority.

Twenty-second year [217], [Fǎ] Zhèng said to Xiānzhǔ: “Cáo Cāo in one moved subdued Zhāng Lǚ, settled Hànzōng, but did not follow up on this momentum to plan to take Bā and Shǔ, and instead left Xiàhóu Yuān and Zhāng Hé to garrison and defend while personally hurriedly returning north; this is not because his wisdom is not farsighted or his strength insufficient, but certainly because the interior has a concern or pressure and that is all. Now considering [Xiàhóu] Yuān's and [Zhāng] Hé's ability and planning, they do not surpass those of our state's Generals and commanders. If we raise armies to go suppress them, then we can certainly overcome them. The day we overcome them, we can expand agriculture and accumulate grain, look for gaps and openings, at best we can overthrow our enemy and restore the Ruling Household, at middling we can nibble away at Yōng and Liáng to expand our border territory, and at worst we can firmly defend strategic points, to plan for enduring long. This is what Heaven has given us, and the opportunity cannot be lost.”

Xiānzhǔ liked this plan, and therefore led the various Generals to advance troops to Hànzōng, and [Fǎ] Zhèng also followed and went.

Twenty-fourth year [219] Xiānzhǔ from Yángpíng crossed south over the Miǎn river, followed the mountains to gradually advance, and at Dìngjūn and Xīngshì built camp. [Xiàhóu] Yuān led troops to contest the territory. [Fǎ] Zhèng said: “[We] can strike.” Xiānzhǔ ordered Huáng Zhōng to climb high and beat drums and attack them, greatly defeating [Xiàhóu] Yuān's army, taking the heads of [Xiàhóu] Yuān and others.

Lord Cáo campaigned west, heard [Fǎ] Zhèng's strategy, and said: “I originally knew [Liú Bèi] Xuándé could not have planned this, and this must have been someone else's teaching.” (1)

- (1) Your Servant Sōngzhī believes Shǔ and Hànzōng are like lips and teeth. Ruler Liú's wisdom, how can it not think of that? Supposing the plans were not yet enacted, then Zhèng only started it and that is all. One who listens to and uses excellent strategists to accomplish achievements is a master among hegemonies, who can not be that way? Wèi Wǔ [Cáo Cāo] believed it was another's teaching, how lowly! This was excess words of shame and disgrace, not proper words of true judgement.

[219] Xiānzhǔ was enthroned as King of Hànzhōng, and appointed [Fǎ] Zhèng as Director of the Secretariat and General Protecting the Army. The next year he died, at the time aged forty-five years. Xiānzhǔ wept for him for several days. Posthumous name *Yì-hóu* “Assisting Marklord.” His son Miǎo was bestowed with rank as Marklord Within the Passes, and his office reached Presenting Chariots Colonel and Administrator of Hànyáng.

Zhūgě Liàng and [Fǎ] Zhèng, though their values were not the same, could admire each other’s righteousness. [Zhūgě] Liàng was always impressed with [Fǎ] Zhèng’s wisdom and ability.

When Xiānzhǔ had just taken Imperial Title, and was about to campaign east against Sūn Quán to avenge the disgrace of Guān Yǔ, most of the officials remonstrated, but he would not listen to a single one. Zhāngwǔ second year [222], the main army was heavily defeated, and returned to station at Báidì. [Zhūgě] Liàng sighed and said: “If Fǎ Xiàozhí were still here, then he would have been able to hold back our ruler, and have him not go east, but even if we had gone east, then it certainly would not have been this much of a disaster.” (1)

- (1) Xiānzhǔ struggled with Lord Cáo, was in bad position, and should have retreated, but Xiānzhǔ was greatly furious and would not permit retreat, and none dared remonstrate him. Arrows came down like rain, and [Fǎ] Zhèng therefore went in front of Xiānzhǔ.

Xiānzhǔ said: “Xiàozhí, you need to avoid the arrows.”

[Fǎ] Zhèng said: “You wise lord are personally facing arrows and stones, so why not a petty man like me?”

Xiānzhǔ therefore said: “Xiàozhí, you and I will go together.”

Therefore they retreated.

## APPENDIX C

### Translation of the Appraisals of Pang Tong, Fa Zheng, SGZ 37

[Chén Shòu's] Appraisal: Páng Tǒng was elegant and good associating others, studied classics and pondered strategies, and at the time Jīng and Chǔ said he was a high talent. Fǎ Zhèng clearly recognized successes and failures, had ability for unusual plans and strategies, but was not praised for virtuous character. In comparing to Wèi's ministers, [Páng] Tǒng was like Xún Yù and his brothers and uncles, [Fǎ] Zhèng was like Chéng [Yù] and Guō [Jiā] and their comrades.

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

### Early Sources: Standard Histories

- HHS            *Houhanshu* by Fan Ye with Treatises from *Xuhanshu* by Sima Biao
- HS             *Hanshu* by Ban Gu et al.
- SGZ            *Sanguozhi* by Chen Shou with official commentary by Pei Songzhi

### Early Sources: Other Texts

- ZZTJ           *Zizhi Tongjian* by Sima Guang et al.

### Modern Works

- de Crespigny, Rafe, *Generals of the South: the foundation and early history of the Three kingdoms state of Wu*, Canberra 1990
- de Crespigny, Rafe, *Man from the Margin: Cao Cao and the Three Kingdoms: the Fifty-first George Ernest Morrison Lecture in Ethnology*, Canberra 1990
- de Crespigny, Rafe, "The Three Kingdoms and Western Jin: a history of China in the third century AD:" Part 1 in *East Asian History* 1 (Canberra, June 1991), 1-36; Part II in *EAH* 2 (Canberra, December 1991), 143-165
- de Crespigny, Rafe, *To Establish Peace: being the chronicle of Later Han for the years 189 to 220 AD as recorded in chapters 59 to 69 of the Zizhi tongjian of Sma Guang; translated and annotated*, Canberra 1996
- de Crespigny, Rafe, "A Question of Loyalty: Xun Yu, Cao Cao and Sima Guang," in *Sino-Asiatica: papers dedicated to Professor Liu Ts'un-yan on the occasion of his eighty-fifth birthday*, edited by Wang Gungwu, Rafe de Crespigny and Igor de Rachewiltz, Canberra 2002, 30-59.
- de Crespigny, Rafe, *A Biographical Dictionary of Later Han to the Three Kingdoms (23-220 AD)*, Leiden 2007
- de Crespigny, Rafe, *Imperial Warlord: a biography of Cao Cao, 155-220 AD*, *Sinica Leidensia* v. 99